



Arizona Human
Trafficking Council

Arizona Human Trafficking Council

February 19, 2019, 9:00 AM

Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room

1700 West Washington Street, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

A general meeting of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council was convened on February 19, 2019 at the Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room, 1700 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

Members Present (20)	Members Absent (6)
Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair	Cindy McCain
Marsha Calhoun (representing Barb Trella) by phone	Nathaniel Brown
Sarah Beaumont	Heather Carter
Gary McCarthy	Cara Christ
Rachel Mitchell	Doug Coleman
Brian Freudenthal	Joseph Kelroy
Maria Fuentes	Lois Lucas
Debbie Johnson	
Zora Manjencich	
Katherine Guffey (representing Greg McKay)	
Frank Milstead	
Sheila Polk	
Bandak Lul (representing Dominique Roe-Sepowitz)	
Brian Steele	
Michael Traylor	
James Waring	
Sarah Kent	
Jennifer Crawford	
Kate Brophy-McGee	
Staff and Guests Present (23)	
Nikki Green	TC Colla
Malcolm Hightower	Lacey Fisher
Livia Finman	Samantha Caplinger
Roshelle Johnson	Erin Tangen
Andrea Kadar	Naney Bedion
Stacey Sutherland	Dekoda Gilmore
Michelle Rucker	Shanna Parker
Ginnellie Gutierrez	Leroy Poley

Jessica Engels	Rene Mitchell
Spike	Janise Gabe
Grumpy	Belen Konesky
Speedy	

Call to Order

- **Mr. Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, called the Arizona Human Trafficking Council meeting to order at 9:06 a.m. with 20 members and 23 staff and guests present.

Welcome/Introductions

- **Mr. Orrantia, Co-Chair**, welcomed everyone again and asked all members to introduce themselves.

Approval of Minutes

- **Mr. Orrantia, Co-Chair**, requested a review of the **December 12, 2018** meeting minutes.
 - **Mr. Jim Waring** motioned to accept the **December 12, 2018** minutes.
 - **Lt. Brian Freudenthal** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes.

Bay Area Anti-trafficking Coalition

- **Ms. Betty Ann Hagenau** presented to the council on the work of the Bay Area Anti-trafficking Coalition (BAATC). There are many similarities between the Bay Area and Arizona, including population size, the number of counties, efforts at the county level, awareness campaigns at local universities, and work surrounding the Super Bowl. One challenge specific to the Bay Area is the prominence of entrepreneurial endeavors, resulting in a lack of cohesiveness between business enterprises. Nonprofits, civic groups, and the faith community have been key partners in spreading awareness and promoting a unified message. The Bay Area is a microcosm, representative of what is happening in the rest of the country, as all forms of trafficking take place there. BAATC hosted the Freedom Summit (a biannual event) where the general public was invited to learn about human trafficking. Over 1700 people attended. The Bay Area realized the importance of the “neighborhood watch” model where neighbors are aware of the signs and can report suspicious activity. Through its efforts, BAATC moved the conversation from the prevalence of human trafficking, to equipping those in the position to see victims with how to respond when they do. During the Super Bowl, 58 different organizations fighting trafficking came together. Counties started task forces. The working group “No Trafficking Ahead” was created which came up with common messaging and one website. This is a 365 day a year issue, not just a Super Bowl issue, or something that happens elsewhere. They also started a chain of communication with former traffickers in San Quentin State Prison. They used this group to help understand the business plan during Super Bowl. BAATC also looked at the National Hotline and whether more tips meant more arrests. They realized it was important that the info landed on the right desk within law enforcement, and that the public knew how to give tips that were worthy of following up. California was the least call in state and now they are #1. This is due in part to the amount of trafficking happening in the state, but also a marker of the rising awareness. However, awareness is not affecting business. They are looking into what would put pressure on traffickers. They began putting info into local health clinics, hotels, and transit locations. In the Bay Area there are 670 hotels and it is hard to get trainings into all of them, and all people that work there, not just managers. It is important to target primary intervention players (those that might actually witness trafficking), such as those at the front desk, janitorial staff, and building/facilities maintenance. They have also worked to get airport staff trained, and are looking for ways to expand their reach and make training ongoing, not just a one time event. Property managers and the apartment market in the Bay Area are also on their list to train. Each of the eleven counties in the Bay Area have their own task force, and these task forces update BAATC each month. This is valuable collaboration. There have been several laws passed that require trainings, and more that are on the books

in the Bay Area. However the overall #1 shortfall is the conversation about recovery/restoration of victims. There are only 30 beds in the Bay Area, and getting a job that can support the high cost of living is a challenge.

- **Mr. Gil Orrantia** asked how the coalition has been able to implement prevention curriculum in schools? **Ms. Hagenau** stated that nonprofits such as the Frederick Douglass Foundation, Love Never Fails, and 3 Strands Global have assisted in this. As their primary tool, teachers, parents, and students engage in the Protect Now curriculum, which is offered in seventh through eleventh grade. A contact at the Department of Education in San Mateo was offered to the Council as an additional resource. **Mr. Orrantia** asked if schools have been receptive. **Ms. Hagenau** indicated parental training is key. Savannah Sanders was mentioned as a potential resource, as well. BAATC have shifted their focus from championing teachers toward administration and district level collaboration.

Maricopa County Attorney's Office Update

- **Ms. Lacey Fisher and Ms. Samantha Caplinger**, Deputy County Attorneys at the Maricopa County Attorney's Office, presented on a case that they recently prosecuted: State vs. Josef Dixon. In this case, Dixon (then 28 years old) met a woman, referred to as Miesha, on Plenty of Fish. He asked this woman to move to Arizona where she shortly became "the bottom". Together they recruited another woman, Keysha. With the help of Miesha and Keysha, Dixon trafficked two underage victims (ages 15 and 16). Victim A was sold to Dixon after running away from a foster care group home; Victim B was lured in by the women after being abandoned at a local gas station in a known high-crime area of the city. **Ms. Fisher and Ms. Caplinger** went into detail about each person's history; how online dating applications were used to groom and market the victims; how social media accounts and transcriptions of text messages were used as evidence against Dixon; court proceedings; and how the fortitude of the victims and their willingness to testify were critical to prosecution. Missed opportunities by police officers to rescue the two victims were discussed, emphasizing the need for specialized training to identify indicators (like the See Something/Say Something campaign). **Ms. Fisher and Ms. Caplinger** also discussed the need for individualized offender treatment, acknowledging offenders have their own histories of abuse, neglect, and exploitation.
- **Ms. Sarah Kent** asked if there were updates on the underage victims and how they are doing today. She also asked if any other victims have come forward. **Ms. Caplinger** said they are still in contact with both girls. Both are pursuing their education. Victim B, who was pregnant when Dixon was arrested, has since had her baby. The Phoenix Police Department collected and donated items to the family. There were photos of a third minor found amid the evidence; however, she could not be identified, located, or rescued.
- **Col. Frank Milstead** praised Ms. Fisher and Ms. Caplinger for their empathy and professionalism, and thanked them.
- **Ms. Deb Johnson** asked how long were the victims with their trafficker? **Ms. Fisher** stated 3 weeks..
- **Ms. Sheila Polk** commended their work, and said being involved in these types of cases is very, very difficult. She mentioned the rights of alleged perpetrators; the Human Trafficking Symposium; and the importance of multidisciplinary teams.
- **Ms. Rachel Mitchell** emphasized 100s of hours go into these types of cases. She then asked if we have special probation terms for traffickers. **Ms. Caplinger** said we do not, and that they are essentially subjective. She explained terms are stipulated as part of the plea agreement; however, they do not need to be enforced by probation, so can be overlooked. **Ms. Mitchell** asked if the team would recommend standardized terms, similar to those used in other types of criminal cases (i.e. domestic violence, sex offender, etc.). **Ms. Caplinger** stated she would.

- **Mr. Gil Orrantia** asked if all states allow traffickers to represent themselves in court. **Ms. Fisher** said she suspects yes; however, she has never looked at the issue on a state-by-state basis. She confirmed it is a defendant's right in Arizona and that approximately three quarters opt to represent themselves, while offenders of other crimes do so only about 5% of the time. She suspected this may have to do with power and control and a desire to intimidate victims. **Ms. Mitchell** said there could be policies adopted in the future that protect underage victims from being cross examined by their abuser, or that may allow victims to provide testimony via closed-circuit television.

Phoenix Police Department Update

- **Lt. Brian Freudenthal** presented on the Phoenix Police Department (PD) and the HEAT Unit (formerly Vice Unit), which stands for **H**uman **E**xploitation and **T**rafficking. The Unit rescues juveniles and adult victims of trafficking, works to reduce demand, and addresses community concerns. The daily operations of the unit vary and must be able to change from one day to the next. Some of these operations include, pimp targeting, customer apprehension, and undercover work that targets Johns, Escort/Hotel that targets victims and pimps, and call out response. During Human Trafficking Prevention Month, Phoenix PD did 15 streets and hotel opps during which they recovered 6 juveniles and arrested 7 adults (3 for child sex trafficking). They did 3 house of prostitution investigations, arrested 8 sex buyers and towed their vehicles, and contacted 35 females to include services provided, citations or arrests. Lt. Freudenthal updated the Council on the Collaborative Protocol Update which now has 130 juveniles of which 103 are in placements, 19 have been returned to parents, and 8 have AWOLed. Lt. Freudenthal gave two examples of successful investigations, one example of a successful sentencing, and one example of a survivor who turned her life around and was thankful to the police officers who helped her.
- There were no questions

Sub Committee Reports

- **Outreach and Awareness Subcommittee**
 - **Mr. Gary McCarthy** stated that the subcommittee updated the Human Trafficking 101 Powerpoint presentation and they have three to four 101 presentations scheduled, including Agua Fria bus drivers. **Mr. McCarthy** will be in Washington D.C. for the Subcommittee on Research, Analysis and Information Sharing.
- **Policy Subcommittee**
 - **Ms. Sheila Polk** stated that the committee continues to work on projects outlined for this year, in particular the Human Trafficking 101 for Legislators which will take place on March 20, 2019.
- **Training / Research & Data Subcommittee**
 - **Mr. Bandak Lul (on behalf of Dominique Roe-Sepowitz)** stated that since January, they have had a training with Scottsdale Community College Nursing School and the Tucson District Attorney's Office. On April 12, 2019, they will host a summit. And on May 4, 2019, they will have a First Step Drop-In.
- **Victim Services Subcommittee**
 - **Mr. Brian Steele** stated that the committee will be merging forces with the Phoenix City Task Force. In 2018, 16 service providers (not including law enforcement, hospitals) serviced 187 minors and 321 adults, 138 of these came from the Collaborative (6% AWOL rate).

Future Meeting Dates

- **Co-Chair Gil Orrantia**, announced the next meeting will be on April 9, 2019, at 9:00 a.m.

Call to the Public

- **Co-Chair Gil Orrantia** gave call to the public.
 - **Ms. Stacey Sutherland** and **Ms. Michelle Rucker** informally announced TRUST dis reacquiring the Safe Action Project.
 - **Shanna**, a mother of a trafficking victim, wanted to know why defendants are allowed 36 different trial dates before taking a plea deal.

Adjourn

- **Chairman Gil Orrantia** called for adjournment at 10:50 AM.

Dated 20 of February 2019
Arizona Human Trafficking Council
Respectfully Submitted By:
Nikki Green
GOYFF