



Arizona Human
Trafficking Council

**Arizona Human Trafficking Council
October 21, 2020, 9:00 AM
Virtual Meeting**

1700 West Washington Street, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

A general meeting of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council was convened on October 21, 2020 virtually, 1700 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

Members Present (23)	Members Absent (4)
Cindy McCain, Co-Chair	Kate Brophy McGee
Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair	Lois Lucas
Brian Steele	James Gallagher
Cara Christ	Marsha Calhoun
David Curry	
Debbie Johnson	
Dominique Roe-Sepowitz	
Doug Coleman	
Heather Carter	
Tony Mapp (Proxy for Heston Silbert)	
Jennifer Crawford	
Jill Rable	
Jim Waring	
TC Colla (Proxy for Joseph Kelroy)	
Maria Cristina Fuentes	
Michael Wisehart	
Mike Faust	
Nathaniel Brown	
Rachel Mitchell	
Sarah Beaumont	
Sarah Kent	
Sheila Polk	
Zora Manjencich	
Staff and Guests Present (8)	
Kim Brooks	Eliza Reock
Vianney Careaga	Jamole Callahon
Kristin Sorensen	Angela Salomon
Claire Merkel	
Joanna Jauregui	

Call to Order

- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, called the Arizona Human Trafficking Council meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. with 23 members and 8 staff and guests present. **Director Orrantia** reviewed the procedures of how the remote meeting would be facilitated.

Roll Call

- **Director Orrantia, Co-Chair**, conducted roll call of the Council and took note of Councilmember proxies.

Approval of Minutes

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, requested a review of the **September 15, 2020** meeting minutes.
 - **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** moved to accept the **September 15, 2020** minutes.
 - **Sarah Kent** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes at 9:04 a.m.

National Center for Missing and Exploited Children

- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, introduced **Eliza Reock** of the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC). **Eliza** began her presentation by explaining the mission of NCMEC. In, 2019, NCMEC assisted with approximately 10,500 reports related to possible Child Sex Trafficking (CST). These reports came from every state and cases included both males and females. The average age of CST victims reported missing to NCMEC is only 15 years old. **Eliza** also shared the CST victim demographics as reported to NCMEC. There is a disproportionality between what is reported to NCMEC and what the numbers should be. Females and non-white identified minority groups made up the majority of CST victims reported to NCMEC. In terms of reporting, NCMEC experienced a 98.66% increase in online enticement reports between January and September 2020 versus the same time period in 2019. NCMEC also experienced a 63.31% increase in CyberTipline reports between January and September 2020 versus the same time period in 2019. NCMEC has experienced a 10.12% increase in calls into their hotline between January and September 2020 versus the same time period in 2019. With both kids and adults spending more time online due to school closures and social distancing measures, NCMEC is aware of instances where child predators are using the darknet to discuss this opportunity to entice children to produce sexually explicit material. **Eliza** also noted that the increase in reporting is also due to the rise of conspiracy-related claims about CST.
- **Sarah Kent** asked about what services NCMEC provides and what it is doing to address the disproportionality rate in reporting. **Eliza** described the process in which NCMEC engages in referrals to family advocacy centers, network outreach, and working with mental health professionals. Volunteers are also available to support families. In cases involving CST, local area representatives are also connected. One of the biggest areas they struggle with is sourcing housing amid COVID-19 restrictions. NCMEC also recently launched a new initiative that is aimed at addressing the issue of disproportionate reporting.
- **Delegate Nathaniel Brown** inquired on collaborating with NCMEC and for clarification on the numbers reported involving Native American youth. **Eliza** indicated that the reported number of CST Victims for Native American was 1.0% and was more than happy to discuss further collaboration efforts.

Foster Youth Initiative

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, introduced **Jamole Callahan** of ACTION Ohio & the National Center for Housing and Child Welfare. **Jamole** began his presentation by providing background on how the Foster Youth Initiative (FYI) emerged from the Fostering Stable Housing Opportunities (FSHO) Coalition. The FSHO Coalition, led by ACTION Ohio, includes more than 55,000 foster care alumni and allies. The Coalition partners with the National Center for Housing and Child Welfare, Capitol Hill foster youth champions, and HUD Secretary Ben Carson to combine existing federal programs to eliminate gaps through which foster youth fall into homelessness. These groups have been meeting regularly since 2013 to identify and eliminate synchronization flaws between systems. FYI emerged from HUD leadership and staff interacting directly with youth and taking their policy proposal for FSHO seriously. FYI is written by youth and is a giant step forward

toward ending youth homelessness. Per HUD Notice PIH 2020-28, issued on October 6, 2020, HUD has made changes that expand FYI. FYI is now expanded to all public housing agencies (PHAs) that administer housing choice vouchers and the limit on vouchers per PHA was increased from 25 to 50. **Jamole** also discussed how FYI can be an important tool for not only combatting homelessness, but also human trafficking. Research indicates that foster care can be a protective factor when done properly. Providing services that are universal, predictable, and synchronized can vastly improve the ability of law enforcement to respond, reducing the exposure to trafficking overtime. **Jamole's** full presentation can be viewed at <https://goyff.az.gov/meeting/htc/2020/10/21-0>.

- **Director Mike Faust** asked about better support for the foster care system and whether services are better offered internally or contracted out. **Jamole** responded by differentiating between a case-management model and a liaison/navigator model, and recommended a shift towards the liaison/navigator model. **Jamole** also offered insight from his work experience that they contract out the wrap-around services needed in the liaison/navigator model.
- **Sarah Kent** inquired about the struggles faced when providing the wrap-around services. **Jamole** responded by describing the issue of not having enough housing available. **Jamole** also emphasized the need for more ground-level work to bring landlords into the program to provide young adults more housing opportunities.
- **Delegate Nathaniel Brown** inquired about the work HUD is doing with the Navajo Housing Authority. **Jamole** responded by stating that he will need to look into it more and is more than willing to have further discussion.

YES 2020 Study

- **Mrs. Cindy McCain, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz**, Director of the Office of Sex Trafficking Intervention Research at ASU. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** began her presentation by providing background on the Youth Experiences Survey (YES) Results for 2020. The purpose of the YES study was to determine the gaps in service needs for the particularly vulnerable population and explore how prevalent sex and labor exploitation was as a result of these vulnerabilities. YES has been administered through 4 partnering social service agencies for the past seven consecutive years in the state of Arizona. 2020 presented its own unique challenges with COVID-19 creating critical barriers to providing services to the most vulnerable clients. It is still too soon to know the ultimate impact that COVID-19 had on the homeless youth population. Due to the limited capacity of social service agencies during COVID-19, the number of homeless young adults who participated in the 2020 YES study represented the lowest sample size in the history of the YES study. However, the findings reflect the dire circumstances that homeless young adults continue to find themselves in, including housing instability, job insecurity, mental health and medical challenges, substance use, and the presence of sexual and labor exploitation.
- **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** proceeded to explain the research questions and methodology used in the YES study, as well as the study's results. Almost half (n = 37, 45.7%) of participants reported experiencing some form of human exploitation, either sex or labor. Nine (11.1%) participants reported experiencing both sex trafficking and labor exploitation. Twenty participants (24.7%) reported experiencing labor exploitation. Twenty-four (29.6%) participants reported experiencing sex trafficking. Of the twenty-four participants who reported experiencing sex trafficking, 12.5% reported that they were afraid to leave the situation due to fear of violence against self or family. Participants who reported being sex trafficked were significantly more likely to experience: identify as LGBTQ, self-harming behavior, and dating violence. Of the twenty participants who reported experiencing labor exploitation, eight (40%) participants reported having been tricked or forced into doing work that they did not want to do.
- **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** concluded by stating that despite a decrease in sample size from the 2019 YES study, the findings from the 2020 YES study remain consistent across the 7 years with regard to the most critical vulnerabilities to the sex trafficked and labor exploited homeless young adults in the state of Arizona: self-harm, attempted suicide, history of abuse, experiencing 4 or more ACEs, drug use, and PTSD. The full presentation can be viewed at <https://goyff.az.gov/meeting/htc/2020/10/21-0>.
- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, thanked **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** for her presentation.

Workgroup Updates

- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz**, Chair of the Data & Research Workgroup, for an update on their Workgroup. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** updated the Council on the two needs-assessments that the research team is working on in regards to victim services and family advocacy centers. Additionally, the YES Report came out today and the STARFISH Fund is selling jewelry and stickers online to raise money and awareness.
- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, introduced **Director Debbie Johnson**, Chair of the Outreach & Awareness Workgroup, for an update on their Workgroup. **Director Johnson** updated the Council on the meeting that occurred yesterday with the GOYFF team and the direction she is taking to recruit members to serve on the Workgroup.
- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, introduced **Sheila Polk**, Chair of the Policy Workgroup, for an update on their Workgroup. **Sheila** updated the Council that the Policy Workgroup had not met recently but is still working to identify obstacles to felony convictions and expungement.
- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Sarah Beaumont**, Co-Chair of the Victim Services Workgroup, for an update on their Workgroup. **Dr. Beaumont** updated the Council that the Workgroup is still in the process of putting up their training videos on the GOYFF Website and will notify the Council when this is done.

Upcoming Meeting

- **Mrs. Cindy McCain, Co-Chair**, reminded Councilmembers to mark their calendars for the next Council meeting on December 1, 2020

Adjournment

- **Director Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, thanked everyone for being part of the meeting and asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting.
 - **Delegate Nathaniel Brown** moved to adjourn.
 - **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes and the meeting adjourned at 10:25 a.m.

Dated 21 of October 2020
Arizona Human Trafficking Council
Respectfully Submitted By:
Vianney M. Careaga
GOYFF