



Arizona Human
Trafficking Council

Arizona Human Trafficking Council

April 7, 2021, 9:00 AM

Virtual Meeting

1700 West Washington Street, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

A general meeting of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council was convened on April 7, 2021 virtually, 1700 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

Members Present (23)	Members Absent (3)
Cindy McCain, Co-Chair	Debbie Johnson
Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair	Marsha Calhoun
Brian Steele	Mike Faust
Cara Christ	
David Curry	
Dominique Roe-Sepowitz	
Doug Coleman	
Heather Carter	
Tony Mapp (Proxy for Heston Silbert)	
Jennifer Crawford	
Jill Rable	
Dave Saflar (Proxy for James Gallagher)	
Jim Waring	
Joseph Kelroy	
Lois Lucas	
Michael DeLeon	
Michael Wisehart	
Nathaniel Brown	
Rachel Mitchell	
Sarah Beaumont	
Sarah Kent	
Sheila Polk	
Zora Manjencich	
Staff and Guests Present (9)	
Kim Brooks	Katherine Chon
Vianney Careaga	Lauren Devine
Kristin Sorensen	Kimberly Hogan
Claire Merkel	Angela Salomon
Joanna Jauregui	

Call to Order

- **Mrs. Cindy McCain, Co-Chair**, called the Arizona Human Trafficking Council meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. with 23 members and 9 staff and guests present. **Mrs. McCain** introduced **Director Maria Cristina Fuentes** as the new Co-Chair of the Council. **Mrs. McCain** reviewed the procedures of how the remote meeting would be facilitated.

Roll Call

- **Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair**, conducted roll call of the Council and took note of Councilmember proxies.

Mrs. McCain raised a point of personal privilege to recognize the hard work of **Director Cara Christ** and the Arizona Department of Health Services during the COVID-19 Pandemic.

Approval of Minutes

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, requested a review of the **February 18, 2021** meeting minutes.
 - **Zora Manjencich** moved to accept the **February 18, 2021** minutes.
 - **Nathaniel Brown** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes at 9:06 a.m.

Arizona Human Trafficking Needs Assessment

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** and **Kimberly Hogan** for an update on the Human Trafficking in Arizona: Needs Assessment for Services and Training. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** provided background on the report. This project was funded by the Governor's Office of Youth, Faith, and Family (GOYFF) through the funding from the STOP (Services •Training •Officers •Prosecutors) Violence Against Women Formula Grant Program and supported by the Council. This report summarizes the results of a survey conducted on victim serving organizations in the State of Arizona. The survey also collected information about what victim serving agencies needed to better serve victims of human trafficking. Of the 340 social services agencies identified in the state that work with victims of crime, 100 agencies completed the survey. These agencies are spread throughout the 15 counties in Arizona. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** also noted that some of the agencies that opted to not participate in the survey claimed that they did not serve any human trafficking victims or claimed that human trafficking was not something that happened in their area. These claims can be problematic as they can perpetuate misconceptions of the reality of human trafficking victims.
- Out of the 100 survey respondents, 81% of agencies reported that they have the capacity to provide services to victims of sex trafficking. Of the 73 agencies that responded about how victims of sex trafficking learn about their agency, 81% reported that victims are referred to them by other service provider referrals, 67% reported word of mouth, 52% reported community outreach, and 51% reported self-referral. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** highlighted a gap in demographic data collection among agencies that was present in the reporting of victim's age, gender, sexual orientation, and race. Some of the biggest needs of sex trafficking resources are training, funding, and receiving referrals. When asked what type of training the agencies have received, the need for more clinical treatment for victims of sex trafficking training was identified. According to agencies who answered questions over half of sex trafficking victims expressed having a barrier or fear of engaging in services due to feelings of shame (58%), not self-identifying as a victim (58%), and having little to no social support (54%).
- Out of the 100 agency survey respondents, 29% of agencies provide services to victims of labor trafficking. Of these 29 agencies 69% reported that victims are referred to them by other service provider referrals, 52% reported word of mouth, 48% reported community outreach, and 45% reported self-referral. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** noted that the same gap in demographic data collection among agencies that was present for sex trafficking victims was also present in the reporting of labor trafficking victims' age, gender, sexual orientation, and race. Some of the biggest needs of labor trafficking resources are training, receiving

referrals, and funding. The need for more clinical treatment for victims of labor trafficking training was identified. According to participating agencies over three out of every four reported a lack of knowledge about resources (78%), two out of three reported having little to no social support (67%), a lack of knowledge about victim's rights (61%), and feelings of shame (50%).

- **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** and **Ms. Hogan** concluded by reviewing recommendations based on the report: sex and labor trafficking awareness/training that is victim centered and trauma-informed; sex and labor trafficking specific screening protocols for juveniles and adults; sex and labor trafficking specific clinical treatment interventions; sex and labor trafficking specific programs for adults; social policies that provide funding support and service for adults and juvenile victims of sex and labor trafficking; and events held yearly or on a quarterly basis in a hybrid manner (video conferencing and in-person) to provide trainings, share best practices, and make connections to increase capacity to serve human trafficking victims. The full presentation can be found at <https://goyff.az.gov/meeting/htc/2021/04/07>.
- **Sheila Polk** thanked **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** and **Ms. Hogan** for their work on putting together this report. She further emphasized the importance of services for victims from the perspective of prosecutors. For prosecutors to be successful over the course of the investigation and trial period, the services made available to victims during that time become crucial in maintaining their cooperation. The victims greatly appreciate these services.
- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, stated that the gaps and lack of demographic data was surprising and asked if capturing that missed data is part of or stressed upon in the training that is currently being done around human trafficking. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** responded by stating that it is part of the training. However, she also noted that there continues to be an overemphasis on girls, women, and people of color that stem from assumptions made about human trafficking. The training that is offered aims to also combat this.
- **Brian Steele** thanked **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** and **Ms. Hogan** for pulling all the data and presenting it to the Council. He inquired if there was a plan to get this data into the hands of the places that fund training and some national groups. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** responded by stating that she will be working with **Director Fuentes** on a distribution strategy. She further added that the report is public and accessible to anyone; and that agencies and organizations can use the data in the report to help them in justifying the need for funding from OVC (U.S. Department of Justice Office for Victims of Crime) grants.
- **Joseph Kelroy** commented that funding is a primary focus for the agencies and if the agencies are not seeing clients it becomes harder to maintain and keep clinicians. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** responded by stating that they are trying to find ways in which to provide therapeutic intervention and not need a behavioral health specialist. Finding this "middle ground" can oftentimes be complicated and the concern can be alleviated with more access to funding.

Update: Children's Justice Task Force & Omnibus Bill

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, introduced **Rachel Mitchell**, from the Maricopa County Attorney's Office, for an update on the Children's Justice Task Force and the outcomes from the task force that are impacting the omnibus bill. **Ms. Mitchell** began her presentation by providing background information on the Children's Justice Task Force (CJTF). Arizona uses funding from the Children's Justice Act, which is administered by the U.S. Department of Justice Office for Victims of Crime (OVC), to focus on the investigation, prosecution, and judicial handling of child abuse and neglect. One of its primary goals is to limit additional trauma to the child. These funds are in turn used for training of child abuse investigators such as law enforcement, Arizona Department of Child Services (DCS) investigators, forensic interviewers, and prosecutors; and to fund children's justice coordinators at child/family advocacy centers, multi-disciplinary teams, and at community mandatory reporting training opportunities within Coconino, Gila, Maricopa, Pima, Yavapai, and Yuma counties. The CJTF serves as Arizona's Multidisciplinary Task Force on Children's Justice and is comprised of representatives from selected disciplines involved in handling child abuse and neglect cases. CJTF was recently tasked with conducting a three-year statewide assessment. The assessment resulted in policy, training, and system improvement recommendations for the investigation and prosecution of serious child abuse cases, as defined by federal statute.

- **Ms. Mitchell** then proceeded to describe the recommendations from the Justice for Victims of Child Sexual Abuse Task Force (JVCSATF) that made it into S.B. 1660, which is currently pending in the state legislature. The bill would allow criminal courts to govern a defendant's ability to contact the victim, family, or other minor children if the criminal court finds that contact with other minor children would pose a risk. Children, ages eight and older, placed in out of home care would be required to receive age/developmentally-appropriate materials about sexual abuse, trafficking, and exploitation along with the methods of reporting abuse, unless a doctor or therapist recommends otherwise. The clerk of the court shall report a listing of lawsuit filed with the court concerning sexual abuse and the failure to report. The bill also removes the statute of limitations for child sex trafficking cases, expands the positions of trust definition, limits when *pro se* defendants question child victims, requires the creations of social media and cell phone best practices in schools, and requires consistent mandatory reporting law training. **Ms. Mitchell** also reviewed the JVCSATF civil, education, and criminal recommendations that have yet to be remedied or enacted. The full presentation can be found at <https://goyff.az.gov/meeting/htc/2021/04/07>.
- **Lt. Dave Saflar** inquired about one of the recommendations yet to be enacted that would expand Arizona Department of Education (DOE) jurisdiction to uncertified educators and asked if educators in this context would include parents due to school closures during situations like the COVID-19 Pandemic. **Ms. Mitchell** clarified that the intent behind the expansion of jurisdiction would not include parents but rather those teachers hired by schools that are certified. **Hon. Doug Coleman** added an example of some charter schools hiring teachers without their teaching certification, which would be considered uncertified educator.

National Advisory Committee Update

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Katherine Chon**, Director of the Office on Trafficking in Persons (OTIP) at the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), and **Lauren Devine**, Child Trafficking Prevention and Protection Coordinator at OTIP, for an update on the National Advisory Committee on the Sex Trafficking of Children & Youth in the United States (NAC). **Ms. Chon** began the presentation by expressing her thanks and gratitude for the participation of Arizona through Governor Ducey on the NAC. Additionally, she offered information on additional training resources for [individuals](#) and [healthcare systems](#), and invited Councilmembers to participate in commemorating the efforts of the United States to combat human trafficking by participating in the recording of its [oral history](#). **Ms. Devine** then provided background on the NAC. The NAC was established in 2017 in response to the [Preventing Sex Trafficking and Strengthening Families Act of 2014](#). The NAC advises the Secretary of HHS and the Attorney General on policies to improve the nation's response to the sex trafficking of children and youth. In September 2020, the NAC released a set of recommendations to the states in its interim report, titled [Best Practices and Recommendations for States](#). The interim report included 127 recommendations in 12 key areas: Multidisciplinary Response, Screening and Identification, Child Welfare, Service Provision, Housing, Law Enforcement and Prosecution, Judiciary, Demand Reduction, Prevention, Legislation and Regulation, Research and Data, and Funding and Sustainability. Each recommendation has two tiers. Tier 1 provides initial steps for states that have not yet substantively addressed the sex trafficking of children and youth. Tier 2 provides examples of practices and policies for states already working to address the sex trafficking of children and youth. After reviewing the report, each state will identify a point of contact to collaborate with government agencies, non-government organizations, and other relevant groups to evaluate their state's efforts to implement the NAC's recommendations and highlight innovative and successful work. After receiving the states' self-assessments, the NAC will evaluate their adoption of the recommendations and publish a final report on each state's progress in implementing the recommendations. HHS is available for support and technical assistance. The states' self-assessment survey to be completed and due to the NAC on June 23, 2021. Extensions on completing the assessment may be granted as needed.

Pinal Alliance Against Trafficking Coalition

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, introduced **Chief Richard Jessup**, Chief of Police for San Luis, AZ, for an update from law enforcement partners with the Pinal Alliance Against Trafficking Coalition (PAAT). **Chief Jessup** began his presentation by mentioning the local law enforcement (LEO) partners with PATT. These include police departments in Yuma, San Luis, Somerton, Wellton, Cocopah, Quechan, and Yuma County Sheriff's Department. The LEOs work closely with advocacy centers to connect victims with the services they need. These centers include Amberly's Place, Healing Journey – Yuma, Yuma Regional Medical Center, and, through a personal connection of his, the Phoenix Dream Center. The LEOs have also identified some common issues within the region concerning human trafficking. They see about 22,000 people cross the US-Mexico border legally every day on top of the number of illegal border crossings. **Chief Jessup** explained the difficulty in identifying victims due to processing procedures and provided an example involving a foreign national. He stressed the importance of identifying the right services that individuals, like those described in this example, have access to, but also ensuring that law enforcement are trained to recognize the signs of human trafficking. There are also major truck routes that run through the region, connecting California and the east coast. Yuma is a geographic center for migrant workers, in which they spend half the year in Yuma and the other half in Salinas, CA. The region also sees a lot of people in September during dove hunting season. Yuma is considered the dove hunting capital of the United States and the season attracts many people from other states and other countries. The large movement of people throughout the region puts a strain on law enforcement to keep a focus on human trafficking. **Chief Jessup** recommends that a task force be established devoted to specifically investigate human trafficking within the region. He also recommended that additional training, educational opportunities, recognition, and resources be made available to his and other departments.
- **Joseph Kelroy** mentioned that the Juvenile Justice Services Division of Administrative Office of the Courts is currently collaborating with Union High School to bring human trafficking education to the school and asked if he could get help to connect with the superintendent of school in San Luis so that they can help bring that education into the area. **Chief Jessup** responded by stating that he would be willing to work on making that connection.
- **Tony Mapp** mentioned that DPS sponsors a training that is available to not only DPS troopers but to local law enforcement as well, called Interdiction for the Protection of Children. The training helps officers identify the signs of human trafficking. The training is free of charge and all the host department would have to do is find a location to hold the training. He offered this assistance to **Chief Jessup**.
- **Brian Steele** thanked **Chief Jessup** for his presentation and for this hard work.
- **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** mentioned that in the work she is doing with **Joseph Kelroy** and juvenile probation officers human trafficking can occur both ways on the border, not only from those coming into the United States but also from those entering Mexico. She inquired to what extent do young people from the Yuma area cross over into Mexico. **Chief Jessup** responded by stating that they see an uptick in young people crossing into Mexico when the colleges are in session. It is possible for these young people to be kidnapped and trafficked. He stated that it is important to spread awareness and provide educational resources to not only the young people but their parents as well.
- **Mrs. McCain** mentioned that the McCain Institute will be co-hosting an eight-hour law enforcement training in May that could help with the need for training of law enforcement from the Yuma area.

Workgroup Updates

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** for an update from the Data and Research Workgroup. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** informed the Council that the Workgroup is working with Phoenix Police Department and the 10 other organizations to do street outreach. The goal of the outreach is to connect victims with the services they need. They have also been working on a hotel-related response and have worked with 23 survivors so far. A number of projects are underway with special education teachers and Maricopa County probation officers.
- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, noted that **Director Debbie Johnson** was unable to attend the meeting and as a result there is no update from the Outreach and Awareness Workgroup.

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Sheila Polk** for an update from the Policy Workgroup. **Ms. Polk** informed the Council that the Workgroup leadership met in March to review their accomplishments so far. **Director Fuentes** was thanked for her work in coordinating training for the Fingerprint Clearance Board. The workgroup continues to focus on identifying barriers that inhibit survivors from productively re-entering society. They have also sent out a survey to the Council requesting input on presentations Councilmembers would like to see in the upcoming year and what policies should be reviewed. The Arizona Prosecuting Attorney's Association held a successful human trafficking training in March. It was a full day of training with participation with many Councilmembers.
- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Angela Salomon** for an update from the Victim Services Workgroup. **Dr. Salomon** informed the Council that the Workgroup met in March and **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** and **Kimberly Hogan** presented on the needs assessment so that they may better apply it to the work of the Workgroup. The Workgroup also had Care7 from the City of Tempe present on the integration of their services to help human trafficking victims. They also began reviewing standardized trafficking identification tools for service providers. The next Workgroup meeting will be in May and they plan to review the matrix for navigating the identification tools and will host the Human Trafficking Specialist from DCS for a presentation.

Upcoming Meeting

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, reminded Councilmembers to mark their calendars for the next Council meeting on June 2, 2021.

Special Announcement

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Joseph Kelroy** for an announcement. **Mr. Kelroy** announced that **Teasie Colla** of the Juvenile Justice Services Division of Administrative Office of the Court is retiring. **Ms. Colla** has served as a proxy for **Mr. Kelroy** on the Council and has been instrumental in establishing specialists throughout the state. **Mr. Kelroy** is appreciative of all of the work **Ms. Colla** has done over the years and thanks her for her service. **Director Fuentes**, echoed **Mr. Kelroy's** sentiments and thanked **Ms. Colla** on behalf of the Council.

Adjournment

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, thanked everyone for being part of the meeting and asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting.
 - **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, moved to adjourn.
 - **Brian Steele** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes and the meeting adjourned at 10:35 a.m.

Dated 7 of April 2021
Arizona Human Trafficking Council
Respectfully Submitted By:
Vianney M. Careaga
GOYFF