



Arizona Human
Trafficking Council

**Arizona Human Trafficking Council
September 22, 2021, 9:00 AM
Virtual Meeting**

1700 West Washington Street, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

A general meeting of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council was convened on September 22, 2021 virtually, 1700 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

Members Present (21)	Members Absent (7)
Cindy McCain, Co-Chair	Heather Carter
Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair	Heston Silbert
Brian Steele	Jennifer Crawford
David Curry	Lois Lucas
Debbie Johnson	Marsha Calhoun
Dominique Roe-Sepowitz	Mike Faust
Doug Coleman	Nathaniel Brown
Jill Rable	
Dave Saflar (Proxy for James Gallagher)	
Jim Waring	
Steve Selover (Proxy for Joseph Kelroy)	
Jeramia Ramadan (Proxy for Michael Wisehart)	
Rachel Mitchell	
Rachel Garcia (Proxy for Don Herrington)	
Regina Cobb	
Sarah Beaumont	
Sarah Kent	
Sheila Polk	
Tim Roemer	
T.J. Shope	
Zora Manjencich	
Staff and Guests Present (7)	
Kim Brooks	Chad Brink
Vianney Careaga	Bonnie Locke
Claire Merkel	Angela Salomon
Joanna Jauregui	

Call to Order

- **Mrs. Cindy McCain, Co-Chair**, called the Arizona Human Trafficking Council meeting to order at 9:01 a.m. with 21 members and 7 staff and guests present. **Mrs. McCain** welcomed **Senator T.J. Shope**, **Representative Regina Cobb**, and **Rachel Garcia**, proxy for **Director Don Herrington** from the Arizona Department of Health Services (DHS), as the newest members of the Council.

Roll Call

- **Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair**, conducted a roll call of the Council and took note of Councilmember proxies.

Approval of Minutes

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, requested a review of the **June 2, 2021** meeting minutes.
 - **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** moved to accept the **June 2, 2021** minutes.
 - **Zora Manjencich** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes at 9:06 a.m.

Cyber Security Update

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Director Tim Roemer** for an update from the Arizona Department of Homeland Security (AZDOHS). **Director Roemer** began his presentation by providing background on cyber security. More and more business and life is being conducted in a virtual space, and many times rhetoric on cyber security is over-complicated. The largest data breaches and the largest issues with people falling victim to a wide variety of crimes can be boiled down to simple mistakes such as clicking on a malicious link in a phishing email. In addition to the need of educating people on recognizing the signs of these types of email and having strong password protections, there is a need to educate people on not putting so much of their personal information online. From a cyber security perspective, it has become easier for criminals to go online, whether it is on social media accounts or by using search engines like Google, and find information about people that can be used for nefarious purposes. To help combat this and human trafficking activity online, annual cyber security training has been mandated for all 36,000 State of Arizona employees to protect the data of the 7.5 million citizens of Arizona. Some of the best ways to prevent yourself from becoming a victim of online crimes is to be cautious of who you engage with online, be cautious of what you post online, and give law enforcement the capabilities they need to go after the criminals. As the cyber security mission was moved from the Arizona Department of Administration to the AZDOHS, the cyber security team has been moved to the Arizona Counter Terrorism Information Center (ACTIC). ACTIC, which is run by the Arizona Department of Public Safety (DPS), is a fusion center with state and local law enforcement, as well as federal partners like the Federal Bureau of Investigation. **Director Roemer** thanked **Governor Ducey** for moving the cyber security mission to AZDOHS and thanked **Col. Heston Silbert** of DPS for allowing AZDOHS use of the ACTIC facility. One of the community outreach initiatives that AZDOHS runs is the annual Kids Safe Online Calendar contest. The department intends to promote this contest within the next couple of months and more details can be found at <https://aset.az.gov/cyber-calendar-contest>. The contest engages youth from all Arizona schools on how they can stay safe online. Youth are able to submit their artwork, both physical drawings and digital works, and an entry from each grade-level, kindergarten through 12th grade, is selected for publication in the calendar. This is a great opportunity for outreach into schools. It helps young people understand that even the littlest things like knowing who you are talking to and the posts you make about yourself can help them stay safe. **Director Roemer** is working with DPS to better utilize the AZDOHS team cyber security analysts to develop leads and tips for law enforcement and to assist prosecutors with their cases. Most recently AZDOHS rolled out a cyber liaison officer program to equip law enforcement with the knowledge to better handle cyber security cases. **Director Roemer** is honored to lead AZDOHS and emphasized the continued need to modernize government to meet the demands of the 21st century.
- **Mrs. McCain and Director Fuentes, Co-Chairs**, commended **Director Roemer** on his leadership and appreciated the work that has been done so far in cyberspace.

- **Brian Steele** inquired whether AZDOHS is open to referrals from entities in the private sector that engage in cyberspace. **Director Roemer** responded that his department is open to referrals. As threats continue to evolve and in order to meet those challenges, AZDOHS needs partners that will provide the department the tools it needs to succeed in its mission. Those partnerships can also help drive down the costs borne by the State of Arizona.
- **Sheila Polk** commented that in her work, she has noticed a significant increase in drug dealing activity targeting young people on the social media platforms TikTok and Snapchat. She further inquired if others have noticed an increase in related activity on social media platforms as well. **Director Roemer** responded that more and more criminal activity has some sort of virtual component to it. Law enforcement has recognized this trend and has been reaching out to AZDOHS for assistance on cybercrimes. He further emphasized how pivotal the move of AZDOHS's cyber team to ACTIC is to the success in this area. **Director Fuentes** added that predators also use social media platforms to groom young victims which can also lead to human trafficking activity. **Lt. Dave Saflar** noted that the statements made by **Ms. Polk** and **Director Roemer** accurately describe the trends police departments, specifically Phoenix Police Department, are seeing at the street and operational-level regarding the use of social media platforms for criminal activity.
- **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** inquired if there educational resources that can be given to parents to help them better understand how to keep their children safe online and is there a way to involve the Governor's Office of Youth, Faith and Family in the distribution of those resources. **Director Fuentes** commented that this is a good idea and the details of this project can be better discussed within the Data and Research Workgroup. She further noted that it would be helpful to bring **Director Roemer** into a meeting with the Workgroup to provide additional information on the cybersecurity training for state employees as well. **Mrs. McCain** added that The McCain Institute for International Leadership recently launched a digital campaign called "R.E.A.L. Friends Don't" to provide information and resources for parents. It can be accessed at <https://www.mccaininstitute.org/real-friends-dont/>. The following resource websites were also shared by Councilmembers: <https://www.cyberdive.co/> and <https://www.missingkids.org/education>.
- **Representative Regina Cobb** added that the Council should remember to involve tribal groups like Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women to these conversations about prevention and education. She hopes to have an update from the Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women group at the next meeting.

Criminal Enterprises and Illicit Massage Businesses

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, introduced **Chad Brink**, Arizona Attorney General's Office (AGO), for a presentation on Criminal Enterprises and Illicit Massage Businesses. **Mr. Brink** began his presentation by providing background on money laundering and human trafficking. The AGO, in cooperation with the Arizona Financial Crimes Task Force, has been involved in illicit business investigations for the past seven years with a focus on money laundering in an effort to uncover the criminal organizations involved with human trafficking. In that time, they have been able to uncover a large network of wire transfers in and out of the country and the use of nonprofit organizations, ATMs, and real estate to launder funds for illicit activities. During the course of these investigations, the AGO has seen an increased trend in the use of electronic banking and the use of virtual currencies for human trafficking activity. In June of 2013, the New York Times reported that in 2010 Craigslist made \$44,400,000.00 in one year from prostitution advertisement. This was third of Craigslist's annual gross revenue. The California Department of Justice recorded a jump of 5.3 million dollars in 2008 to over 135 million dollars in 2014 for Backpage in "adult services advertising." At the time this accounted for 90% of Backpage's annual revenue. The evidence derived from this investigation led to the imposition of anti-money laundering regulations onto Backpage. At that time Visa, Mastercard, American Express, and other major money services no longer conduct business with Backpage resulting in Backpage starting to use Bitcoin. This illustrates the need for law enforcement to follow these criminal trends and to gain a better understanding of digital currencies. He then proceeded to provide an example of the type of content that is found in illicit advertisements and called the Councilmembers to the "outcall" section regarding CashApp and Zelle. These are apps that link to bank accounts and credit cards, and in this example allow people to pay for illicit activity using electronic banking methods. **Mr. Brink** then displayed a graph that illustrated the increased use and acceptance of virtual currencies and money services businesses (MSBs) over time. He noted that the AGO

has had human trafficking cases that have involved PayPal, CashApp, and Venmo. **Mr. Brink** noted that AGO and law enforcement entities would appreciate more cooperation in working with MSBs in assisting with these types of investigations. In this new age of money, the following challenges will become more resource intensive and time sensitive: victim rescue operations, customer reduction operations, and illicit massage business investigations. The full presentation can be found at <https://goyff.az.gov/meeting/htc/2021/09/22>.

- **Mrs. McCain** inquired about the impact a potential mistrial with Backpage will have on the issues raised in the presentation. **Mr. Brink** responded by stating that he was not familiar with the facts or reasons that have led to the mistrial, but noted that the investigation and the information derived from it serve as a roadmap for other similar investigations.
- **Brian Steele** inquired about what regulations, legislation, or recommendations would he recommend to curb the use of advertisements for illicit activity. **Mr. Brink** responded that from an investigative perspective, it would help if businesses were more responsive to subpoenas or reduce turnaround time. He added that it would also help if MSBs would be more cooperative when law enforcement requests assistance.

NAC Committee Update

- **Mrs. McCain, Co-Chair**, introduced **Director Fuentes** for an update on the National Advisory Committee on the Sex Trafficking of Children and Youth in the United States (NAC). **Director Fuentes** reminded Councilmembers that NAC put together a report with 127 recommendations for the states and then requested that the states complete a self-assessment to evaluate where the states are in implementing those recommendations. The report also included 34 recommendations for federal agencies. These recommendations were derived from feedback from the states on the lack of guidance from federal agencies on child exploitation and trafficking. The state self-assessments were due to NAC on July 31, 2021. Arizona, along with 12 other states, submitted their self-assessments on time. One state declined to participate in the self-assessment. 18 states have requested and were granted extensions through the end of September and another 18 states made no communication to the NAC about the status of their self-assessments. The 18 states that have made no communication to the NAC will receive a letter from NAC in order to attempt engagement. Federal agencies were also asked to submit assessments and provide feedback on the 34 recommendations that were made to them. These responses are due to NAC on October 29, 2021. The final report that NAC will produce is due to Congress in January 2022 and NAC is supposed to sunset at the end of September 2021. NAC has written a letter to Congress to request that the NAC be extended to January 2024. NAC is awaiting to hear back from Congress, and in the interim NAC is planning to submit a report for January 2022.. If an extension is not granted from Congress, there are some members of the NAC that have requested the committee become a discretionary committee of the U.S. Secretary of Health and Human Services. The various Workgroups of NAC will be meeting to review the responses that have been submitted and to develop the framework for the final report which will describe the efforts of each state to implement the 127 recommendations. Once the report is complete, it will be made available on the NAC website and be made publically available.
- **Representative Regina Cobb** inquired about how Arizona ranked among the 127 recommendations. **Director Fuentes** responded by stating that NAC is currently engaged in the work of reviewing those responses and how to summarize that information. There has not been a discussion about rankings. As of September 7, 2021 and to the extent that committee staff had reviewed what the states have sent in, 39% of the responses were not applicable, 21% of the responses were at tier one, and 40% of the responses were at tier two.
- **Brian Steele** inquired about the objective of NAC, Arizona's role and the long term goals of the NAC. **Director Fuentes** responded by stating that NAC was established to advise the U.S. Attorney General and the U.S. Secretary of Health and Human Services on the nation's response to human trafficking. The NAC was also set up to gather information and made recommendations to states and federal agencies should be doing to better address child sex trafficking around the country. **Director Roemer** added that Arizona hosted a NAC meeting a few years ago and thanked everyone who has participated in this effort. **Director Fuentes** also noted that a unique facet of Arizona's involvement with NAC is that **Governor Ducey** is the only sitting

governor serving on NAC. Due to his appointment to the NAC, Arizona's participation on NAC has been robust.

- **Director Fuentes** also thanked **Claire Merkel, Joanna Jauregui, and Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** for their help on the state self-assessment for Arizona.

DPS NLETS Program

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Bonnie Locke**, Chief Marketing Officer of the National Law Enforcement Telecommunications System (NLETS), for a presentation on how the NLETS technology service supports human trafficking efforts throughout law enforcement communities. **Ms. Locke** began her presentation by providing background on NLETS. NLETS used to be housed in Arizona DPS 56 years ago. They now have their own state-of-the-art facility in Phoenix, AZ. She extended a standing invitation to the Councilmembers to tour the facility. NLETS is a not-for-profit organization owned by the states. **Ms. Locke** emphasized that NLETS is not the same as the FBI National Crime Information Center (NCIC). She then explained the data flow between multiple agencies. In terms of year to date total transactions through May 2021, NLETS has processed 1,256,504,176 transactions. The average round trip message response time is 1.85 seconds. A large portion of the NLETS network is used for driver and vehicle information as well as criminal history information. NLETS has recently engaged the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC) and Polaris in discussions to support working more closely to share relevant human trafficking information with law enforcement. Additionally, NLETS has surveyed its members to determine interest and capability of sharing this information with other states. The results have shown that all states are interested in sharing and most are willing and able to do so. Some indicated there may be restrictions on sharing the information outside of their state. In regards to next steps, NLETS would like to identify states and agencies to partner with and pilot support for them. The full presentation can be found at <https://goyff.az.gov/meeting/htc/2021/09/22>.
- **Brian Steele** inquired, based on the conversations heard today, how NLETS services could better link services together for Arizona. **Ms. Locke** responded that her initial sense of how NLETS could assist would be to help automate certain manual processes to better facilitate information exchange. Additionally, they have discussed secure storage of data.

Workgroup Updates

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** for an update from the Data and Research Workgroup. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** informed the Council that the Workgroup has two upcoming training events on September 27, 2021 for social service providers that work with human trafficking survivors and to assist law enforcement with motivational interviewing. There will also be a Labor Trafficking Symposium on October 20 and 21, 2021. Survivors, providers, prosecutors, and The McCain Institute for International Leadership have provided trainers for this two-day event. Additionally, there will be a series of trainings in the fall geared towards increasing the capacity of Pima County to better respond to children who have been trafficked. The second will focus on training the investigatory staff with the Arizona Department of Corrections, Rehabilitation and Reentry. The third will focus within the space of special education. There will also be a drop-in center event on December 4, 2021. She asked for support with donations for the drop-in center event. **Director Fuentes** noted that the Governor's Youth Commission may be able to help with raising donations for the drop-in center.
- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Director Debbie Johnson** for an update from the Outreach and Awareness Workgroup. **Director Johnson** informed the Council that the Workgroup met last month and has been focusing on education and awareness for big events including the 2023 Super Bowl. The Workgroup is preparing a list of who they would like to engage with in preparation for the Super Bowl. She also recently met with the organizing group from Los Angeles for the 2022 Super Bowl. The Workgroup intends to launch its efforts for the 2023 Super Bowl in February 2022. Director Johnson stressed that the workgroup is not only focused on the Super Bowl, but all major events that take place within the State. In the next few years there will be several major sporting events that take place that the created processes can support.

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Sheila Polk** for an update from the Policy Workgroup. **Ms. Polk** informed the Council that the Workgroup recently met on August 30, 2021. The Workgroup recently sent out a survey to solicit policy recommendations and ideas from Councilmembers. One of these recommendations involved putting together a 45 to 60 minute human trafficking 101 training course. This training opportunity would be web-based and made available to the public. The Workgroup also recognized that some of the recommendations from Councilmembers have already been implemented and the Workgroup will work on a legislative update for one of the upcoming Council meetings. She also recognized **Director Fuentes** for not only co-chairing the Council but for also serving as an active member of the Policy Workgroup. **Director Fuentes** thanked **Ms. Polk** for her leadership as well and thanked the Councilmembers for participating in the policy survey.
- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, introduced **Dr. Angela Salomon** for an update from the Victim Services Workgroup. **Dr. Salomon** informed the Council that the Workgroup met on September 3, 2021. The Workgroup continues to incorporate diverse community representation by inviting community partners to present at their Workgroup meetings and share the work they do throughout the state. The Workgroup is also moving forward with its matrix tool to help service providers better identify victims of human trafficking and will be continuing to review its Workgroup goals at a future meetings to ensure focus on the goals/objectives of the workgroup. The next meeting is scheduled for November 5, 2021.
- **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** raised the point that a presentation on the validated screening tool for Juvenile Probation would be beneficial for the Council in the future. **Director Fuentes** thanked **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** for that recommendation and reminded Councilmembers that they can submit future meeting presentations to herself and **Kim Brooks**.

Upcoming Meeting

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, reminded Councilmembers to mark their calendars for the next Council meeting on October 20, 2021.

Adjournment

- **Director Fuentes, Co-Chair**, thanked everyone for being part of the meeting and asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting.
 - **Director Debbie Johnson** moved to adjourn.
 - **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes and the meeting adjourned at 10:33 a.m.

Dated 22 of September 2021
Arizona Human Trafficking Council
Respectfully Submitted By:
Vianney M. Careaga
GOYFF