



GOVERNOR'S ADVISORY COUNCIL ON AGING

Sunset Review Report 2009 - 2019

Respectfully Submitted to

Senator Kate Brophy McGee, Representative Nancy Barto
and other honorable members of the Committee of Reference

Hand Delivered to

Cherie Stone
Senate Health and Human Services Research Analyst
Arizona State Senate
1700 West Washington
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Responses to Factors 1 – 13	p. 3
Repsonsese to Additional Questions 1 – 4	p. 8
Appendices	
Council 2019 Membership Terms and Bios, and Past Council Member Roster 2009-2018	A
Council By-Laws	B
Council and Committee 2018- 2019 Objectives / Tracking Grids	C
Council Annual Reports 2009-2018	D
Legislative Update Example	E
Statewide Training Flyers	F
Community Fact Sheets and Council Rack Card	G
Council Liaisons	H
Executive Director Community Participation	I
Council Letters of Support	J
Council Officer and Committee Descriptions	K
Council and Committee Minutes, 2018 – current	L

RESPONSES TO FACTORS 1 – 13

1. *The objective and purpose in establishing the agency and the extent to which the objective and purpose are met by private enterprises in other states.*

The objective and purpose in establishing the Governor’s Advisory Council on Aging as authorized by legislation in 1980 (A.R.S. 46-183, 46-184): “to advise the governor, legislature and all state departments which the council deems necessary on all matters and issues relating to the aging, including the administration of the State Plan on Aging.” Arizona has also designated the Governor’s Advisory Council on Aging as its State Advisory Council on Aging, as set forth in the federal Older Americans Act of 1965, as amended (45 CFR 1321.47). (**Appendix A, 2019 Council Membership Terms and Bios; Past Council Member Roster 2009-2018**) In alignment with the objective and purpose, the Governor’s Advisory Council on Aging By-Laws summarize the following responsibilities of the Council (**Appendix B, Council By-Laws**):

- Direct the development of and approve the State Plan on Aging; monitor and evaluate implementation of the state plan and submit yearly recommendations to the Governor, the Speaker of the House and Senate President
- Discuss and recommend actions to all state agencies on program, policy and development that affect the Arizona older adult population
- Develop legislative priorities and advocate for such, both in respect to short-term and comprehensive long-range plans and goals on aging
- Actively facilitate the coordination of federal, state, local and private organizational policies and programs concerning services to older residents
- Serve as a dissemination point for information on aging related issues and direct service programs
- Prepare and submit an annual report to the Governor, legislative leadership and Agency Directors on the activities undertaken by the Council
- Promote public understanding and acceptance of programs and services relating to the well-being of the state’s older adult population
- Advocate for older Arizonans and actively promote policies to further their well-being

We cannot address the extent other states utilize private agencies as liaisons between their legislatures and state departments. We feel that utilizing private agencies in this capacity removes any non-partisan value and risks private agencies putting their needs over the needs of older adults. Other states have Governor’s Advisory Councils on Aging, however, not all are established by statute as in Arizona.

We are grateful Arizona demonstrates the value of their 1.6 million older adult population by investing in the Governor’s Office on Aging and Advisory Council on Aging. For more than 38 years, the Council has developed and coordinated collaborative aging-related initiatives involving private and public entities, launched new and nationally recognized efforts to address aging-related priorities, and advocated for Arizona’s rapidly growing, diverse and often vulnerable older adult population. Since the Governor’s Office on Aging opened in 2007, our productivity has increased as we have worked together to raise the profile of the state’s older adult population. The Council and Office provide a venue where older adults can express concerns and feel confident their voice will reach policymakers. As an educational resource, the Council provides a valuable non-partisan perspective for the Governor, Legislature, state departments and community agencies.

2. *The extent to which the agency has met its statutory objective and purpose and the efficiency with which it has operated.*

Over the past ten years, the Council has consistently strived to maximize efficiency while continuing to meet our statutory objective and purpose to represent the best interests of Arizona's 1.6 million older adults. The Council leverages all available resources by fully utilizing the skills, abilities and resources of council members, community partners and the small Office staff (1- 4 people). The Council has developed and maintained statewide partnerships with state agencies, area agencies on aging, aging service providers, university programs and others to produce events/products/outcomes designed to address the needs and concerns of older Arizonans.

In 2014, the Council established an Ad-Hoc Committee to implement a strategic review of all current procedures and processes to improve effectiveness and efficiency. In alignment with the Arizona Management System (AMS), approved recommendations have included use of measurable objectives for the Council and all committees; modifying meeting days and times; scheduling a phone call meeting on alternate months of in-person meetings; establishing email voting process to use when needed; restructuring orientation process and timing; and initiating steps to ensure all Council members are fully engaged. **(Appendix C, Council and Committee 2018-2019 Objectives and Tracking Grid; Annual activity detail in Appendix D, Council Annual Reports 2009-2018)**

Notable outcomes include:

- For more than two decades, the Council has provided a weekly nonpartisan e-newsletter during the legislative session and monthly between sessions. The Office and Council Executive Director researches, tracks and reports on state and federal legislation that affects older Arizonans through the *Legislative Update*. The intent of the e-newsletter is keep older Arizonans and advocates of aging services informed about bills and actions taking place at the Arizona State Legislature and highlight federal legislation or activities affecting older Americans. Each issue includes news and resources at the national, state and local level. **(Appendix E, Legislative Update Example)**
- The Office created and coordinated the Aging 2020 Plan. In alignment with AMS, the Office and the Council recommended a transition and full collaboration by all state 2020 agencies around the federally mandated State Plan on Aging; that transition is ongoing and reflected in the 2019-2022 State Plan on Aging.
- In 2010, building on earlier work by the Council's Social, Health and Alzheimer's Committee, the Council and Office launched the statewide Arizona Fall Prevention Coalition with funding through the Virginia G. Piper Charitable Trust and helped transition the coalition to the Arizona Department of Health Services to ensure statewide representation and sustainability.
- In 2011 and 2012, the Council and Office supported the Arizona Caregiver Coalition's development of the Respite Care Network and launch of the Caregiver Resource Line. The Arizona Caregiver Coalition was another initiative of the Council's Social, Health and Alzheimer's Committee (2006). Chair O'Neill is now a Board Member.
- In 2015, Council and Office participated in the White House Conference on Aging regional forums.

- The Office was a lead partner in the creation of the Arizona State Plan on Alzheimer’s disease and the coordination of the Arizona Alzheimer’s Task Force and its Steering Committee. Council Chair O’Neill is a Steering Committee Member.
- Thirty Senior Action Day events were held in communities around the state. Older adults and advocates joined Council members, Office staff, state legislators, local elected officials and federal staff to talk about shared concerns. Senior Action Day events provide a convenient venue that allows direct communication between older adults and state legislators, local officials, Council members, and other advocates to discuss shared concerns. Data regarding top concerns for older Arizonans collected at each event and via a stakeholder survey was shared in the Council Annual Reports for 2009, 2011, 2013, 2015 and 2017. **(Appendix F, Statewide Training Flyers; Appendix D, Council Annual Reports 2009-2018)**
- The Council and Office collaborated with the Western Arizona Council of Governments, Area Agency on Aging Region IV to provide first responders a unique training experience via a Virtual Dementia Tour, an evidence based dementia simulation program. Two events trained 150 first responders and community members. **(Appendix F, Statewide Training Flyers)**
- The Council’s Marketing Committee has created six Community Fact Sheets designed to provide education on important aging and caregiving issues. Topics include Elder Abuse; Financial Abuse – Common Scams Targeting Arizona Older Adults; Dementia and Falls; Dementia and Fire Safety; Dementia and Guns; and Honoring Last Wishes. The Marketing Committee also created a Rack Card that includes basic information regarding the Council – who we are and what we do. **(Appendix G, Community Fact Sheets and Council Rack Card)**
- In February 2017, based on efforts by the Council to establish a bipartisan work group, the Senior Caucus, now called the Community and Legislative Partners in Aging, was created. These monthly meetings (exception, June-August) provide a non-partisan forum for policymakers, organizations, and community members to discuss potential policy solutions for issues affecting older Arizonans. Lead legislative partners include Senator Heather Carter, Senator Lela Alston, Representative Regina Cobb and Representative Jennifer Jermaine. The Office and Council provide logistical support.
- In 2018-2019, the Council was included as a partner in Arizona Senate Bill 1172 – Family Caregiver Grant Program. The purpose of this bill is to establish a fund to reimburse family caregivers for 50% of qualifying expenses, up to \$1,000 per qualifying family member. When requested by DES DAAS, the Council’s role will be to assist with approving applications and allowable expenses. We know \$1,000 is nowhere near the average caregiver out of pocket expenses of \$7,000+ a year, but we are hopeful SB 1172 will lead to future bipartisan efforts to support family caregivers.
- Council members have volunteered more than 1800 hours (2017, 2018 and through 7/2019) on Council related activities and aging related community outreach across the state. While the financial worth of these volunteer hours (if based on current value of volunteer time of \$24.69 per hour) would be estimated in the tens of thousands of dollars, the true value to the Governor’s Administration and the state is the contribution of work that is done on behalf of all older Arizonans.

3. The extent to which the agency serves the entire state rather than specific interests.

The Council strives to serve the entire state in multiple ways. First, Boards and Commission considers geographic location during their application review process. Over the past 10 years, we have had members from across the state, representing both urban and rural communities of all population sizes. **(Appendix A, 2019 Council Membership Terms and Bios; Past Council Member Roster 2009-2018)** Our state liaisons keep us informed of their statewide programs and activities. **(Appendix H, Council Liaisons)** The Council and Office have hosted several statewide events and training opportunities including Senior Action Days and Virtual Dementia Tours. Furthermore, although the Council has not been able to hold the annual Governor’s Conference on Aging during this review period, with the monetary public support received from past conferences the Council has been able to sponsor several statewide education and training events, including:

- The Arizona Association of Area Agencies on Aging (AZ4A) Conference
- The Arizona Caregiver Coalition Family Caregiver Day at the Capitol
- Alzheimer’s Association Day at the Capitol
- Governor’s Office on Tribal Relations Annual Indian Nations and Tribes Legislative Day
- Arizona Indian Council on Aging Conference
- Western Arizona Council of Government Annual Conference
- Northern Arizona Council of Government Annual Conference

4. The extent to which rules adopted by the agency are consistent with the legislative mandate.

The Governor’s Advisory Council on Aging is a policy review and advisory body and does not have regulatory authority. The Council’s By-Laws reflect authorizations under Laws 1980, Chapter 150, covered by A.R.S. 46-183, 46-184 and provisions of the Older Americans Act of 1965, P.L. 89-73, 87 STAT.30, 42 U.S.C. 3001 et seq. and C.F.R. 1321.47 (as amended) promulgated pursuant to the Act. **(Appendix B, Council By-Laws)**

5. The extent to which the agency has encouraged input from the public before adopting its rules and the extent to which it has informed the public as to its actions and their expected impact on the public.

While the Council does not have regulatory authority, in its advisory capacity and in support of its mission “to enhance the quality of life for older Arizonans,” the Council does serve as a forum whereby identified needs and state program or service delivery system issues affecting older Arizonans are addressed. In addition, proposed revisions to the Council’s By-Laws are posted for public review and input at least 60 days prior to any official action, and the Council provides opportunities for the public to provide input at the Council meetings.

6. The extent to which the agency has been able to investigate and resolve complaints that are within its jurisdiction.

The Council and Office work to link older adult constituents who have concerns with appropriate resources to resolve complaints and concerns. Per 2018 tracking, the Office manages an estimated 250 requests per month for assistance via phone calls, emails, US mail, faxes, and walk-ins. Requests for assistance come from older constituents or their families, state agency staff, and legislators or legislative staff seeking specific information to resolve issues related to aging family members and friends. The

contacts are often the result of the desire to find one resource for resolution of the concern, and the Council and Office take pride in providing prompt and supportive assistance.

In addition, the Office on Aging Executive Director has served in advisory capacity on both public and state committees and councils that address and/or resolve concerns affecting older Arizonans. (**Appendix I, Executive Director Community Participation**)

7. *The extent to which the attorney general or any other applicable agency of state government has the authority to prosecute actions under the enabling legislation.*

The Attorney General has authority to ensure the Council, as a public body, adheres to laws governing Open Meetings. As part of orientation and continuing education, the Council members participate in annual training specific to the Open Meeting Law.

8. *The extent to which agencies have addressed deficiencies in their enabling statutes that prevent them from fulfilling their statutory mandate.*

As a result of recommendations made during previous sunset reviews, the Council's enabling statutes do not prevent the Council from fulfilling its statutory mandate.

9. *The extent to which changes are necessary in the laws of the agency to adequately comply with the factors listed in A.R.S. § 41-2954.*

The Council has no recommendations for changes in laws of the agency.

10. *The extent to which the termination of the agency would significantly affect the public health, safety or welfare.*

The termination of the Governor's Advisory Council on Aging would mean older adult Arizonans would lose statewide representation; they would not have a single, non-partisan voice of advocacy to the Governor, Legislature, and state departments. Without the Council, the Governor, Legislature, and state departments risk passing incomplete or ineffective policy/legislation without the use of a central point of contact to provide up-to-date information regarding aging-related education, training and research, and targeted older adult viewpoints on critical issues. Due to Arizona's rapidly growing, diverse and often vulnerable older adult population, the Council's efforts to address issues facing Arizona seniors – both now and in the future - are critical to the health, safety and welfare of all older Arizonans. (**Appendix J, Council Letters of Support**)

11. *The extent to which the level of regulation exercised by the agency compares to other states and is appropriate and whether less or more stringent levels of regulation would be appropriate.*

The Council has no regulatory authority.

12. *The extent to which the agency has used private contractors in the performance of its duties as compared to other states and how more effective use of private contractors could be accomplished.*

Council and Office members and volunteers have performed the majority of Council duties over the past decade resulting in very minimal or no use of contractors. If use of a private contractor is deemed necessary, it is accomplished through private sector funding provided in support of the Council event.

13. *The extent to which the agency potentially creates unexpected negative consequences that might require additional review by the committee of reference, including increasing the price of goods, affecting the availability of services, limiting the abilities of individuals and businesses to operate efficiently and increasing the cost of government.*

Standard procedures require Council and Office to seek guidance from our assigned Policy Advisor on any issue that might result in an unintended or unexpected negative consequence. If an unintended or unexpected negative consequence were to occur, the Council would report (verbally and in writing) immediately to our Policy Advisor, and would include such communication and resulting outcome in this report. Council and Office are unaware of any unintended or unexpected negative consequences that have occurred in the past 10 years.

ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS 1-4

1. *Identify the problem or the needs that the agency is intended to address.*

The Council is composed of 15 members appointed by the Governor “to advise the governor, legislature and all state departments which the council deems necessary on all matters and issues relating to the aging, including the administration of the State Plan on Aging.” The members come from various geographic, cultural, professional, and personal backgrounds relevant to the issues facing older Arizonans. The Governor’s Advisory Council on Aging is also designated as the State Advisory Council on Aging, as set forth in the federal Older Americans Act of 1965, as amended (45 CFR §1321.47). In this role as the State Advisory Council, the body advises the federally designated State Unit on Aging (the Division of Aging and Adult Services within the Department of Economic Security) on the development and implementation of the State Plan on Aging, and in the development and operations of policies and programs for older adults. Pursuant to its mandate and in line with its mission, the Council reviews state policies, programs and service delivery systems that are critical to the overall health and well-being of older Arizonans.

The Council has four (4) Standing Committees: the Executive Committee, the Legislative & Policy Education Committee, the Aging in Community Committee, and the Marketing Committee. Ad hoc committees are created as needed for special purposes and projects. The Council and all Committees accomplishes specific measurable objectives through the work of these committees. Annual objectives are determined from yearlong input from older adult community members, liaisons, aging-related agencies, and policymakers. (**Appendix K, Council Officer and Committee Descriptions; Appendix C, Council and Committee 2019 Objectives and Tracking Grid; Appendix L Council and Committee Minutes 2018-current**)

2. *State, to the extent practicable, in quantitative and qualitative terms, the objectives of the agency and its anticipated accomplishments.*

As part of the strategic planning process, the Office tracks achievement of Council goals and objectives through performance measures related to the purpose of the Council. Those quantitative measures may include the number of Council meetings, conferences, trainings held and the number of seniors participating in these outreach efforts. Other quantitative measurements comprise the number of seniors informed on legislative issues through Senior Action Day and the Council’s legislative newsletter. The

collection of this information assists the Council in identifying its accomplishments and helps determine barriers, as applicable. (**Appendix C, Council and Committee 2019 Objectives and Tracking Grid; Annual activity detail in Appendix D, Council Annual Reports 2009-2018; Appendix L Council and Committee Minutes 2018-current**)

In accordance with A.R.S. 46-183, 46-184, the Council provides the Governor, the Speaker of the House and Senate President with an Annual Report. (**Appendix D, Council Annual Reports 2009-2018**)

3. *Identify any other agencies having similar, conflicting or duplicative objectives, and an explanation of the manner in which the agency avoids duplication or conflict with other such agencies.*

Due to the specific objective and purpose of the Council, no other agencies have similar, conflicting or duplicate objectives. The Council and Office work in tandem with the DES Division of Aging and Adult Services to provide oversight of the State Plan on Aging for DES. The Council and Office collaborate with several state liaisons to ensure timely identification of service delivery duplication, and implementation of quality improvement efforts. (**Appendix H, Council Liaisons**)

4. *Assess the consequences of eliminating the agency or of consolidating it with another agency.*

The consequences of eliminating the agency:

- More than 1.6 million older Arizonans would be without a single, nonpartisan voice of advocacy to the Governor, the Legislature and the State Departments.
- Decision makers risk passing incomplete or ineffective policy/legislation without a central point of contact to provide up-to-date information regarding aging related education, training and research, and targeted older adult viewpoints on critical issues.
- Older Arizonans and their families, aging advocates, state agencies, and others would no longer have a direct link to the Governor via the Council and Office.
- The State would no longer meet federal mandates for oversight of the State Plan on Aging through the Governor’s Advisory Council on Aging.

Arizona is the fourth-fastest growing state and is the sixth largest in the country, covering 113,634 square miles, and divided into 15 counties, 13 of which are rural. Approximately, 17% of all Arizonans are 65 years or older, while 25% of Arizona’s rural population are age 65+. Arizona’s heavy urban concentration combined with a broadly dispersed rural population presents unique challenges, especially for the older adult population. Our state continues to need a designated Council whose function is to watch over the interests of older citizens. Today’s older adults are living longer than ever before. The number of older Arizonans is expected to nearly double by 2050, while the older adult minority populations are expected to triple. In light of these demographics and the current economic trend, the Governor’s Advisory Council on Aging’s role is as important today as when it was created. (**Appendix J Council Letters of Support**)

The consequences of consolidating the Council with another Governor’s Council or Office:

- The Council is very agreeable to consolidation with another Governor’s Council or Office. We serve at the pleasure of the Governor and share a common desire to ensure Arizona’s older adults are fairly represented, and provided best practice care and services. We would request the consolidated Council or Office new name include the word “Aging” to promote inclusivity and public awareness.