

Arizona Human Trafficking Council October 19, 2022, 9:00 AM Hybrid Meeting

1700 West Washington Street, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007 A general meeting of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council was convened on **October 19, 2022** 1700 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

Members Present (17)	Members Absent (14)
Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair	Representative Regina Cobb
Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair	Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz
Zora Manjencich	Councilman Jim Waring
Dir. Joseph Kelroy	Delegate Nathaniel Brown
Keith Moffitt (Proxy for Dir. Faust)	Marsha Calhoun
Jennifer Crawford	Jim Gallagher
Jill Rable	Nick Alamshaw
Jeramia Garcia Ramadan (Proxy for Dir. Wisehart)	Captain Eric Swanson
Maj. Jennifer Pinnow (Proxy Dir. Silbert)	
Dep. Dir. Susan Dzbanko (Proxy for Dir. Roemer)	
Teresa Aseret-Manygoats (Proxy for Dir. Herrington)	
Senator T.J. Shope	
Sarah Chung	
Deborah Serrata	
Dr. Sarah Beaumont	
Dir. Debbie Johnson	
Captain David Curry	
Hon. Doug Coleman	
Brian Steele	
Staff and Guests Present (5)	
Kainoa Spenser, GOYFF	Joanna Jauregui, McCain Institute
Amy Peep, GOYFF	Dr. Angela Salomon
Alec Thomson, LAVIDGE (Speaker)	

Call to Order

• Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, called the Arizona Human Trafficking Council meeting to order at 9:03 a.m. with 17 members and 5 staff and guests present. She reviewed the procedures of the Council meeting, welcomed all those joining via Zoom and thanked them for their flexibility.

Approval of Minutes

- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, requested a review of the September 21, 2022 meeting minutes.
 - Keith Moffitt (Proxy for Director Faust) moved to accept the September 21, 2022 minutes.
 - Teresa Aseret-Manygoats (Proxy for Director Herrington) seconded the motion.
- The motion passed with no dissenting votes at 09:06 a.m.

DEMA Anti-Trafficking Fund Update

- Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, started by reminding the Council of Darlene Quihuis', Assistant Director of the Arizona Division of Emergency Management (DEMA), presentation at the last meeting, explaining the recently awarded Anti-Human Trafficking Fund and how DEMA plans to distribute these monies.
- Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, stated there has been an update regarding the status of the DEMA Anti-Human Trafficking Fund and that details of the application process have been developed, and a copy of the Program are located in the blue folders distributed to council members attending in person and available on GOYFF website for those attending virtually.
- Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, discussed how the frequently asked questions (FAQs) document has been finalized, emailed to council members, and will also be distributed to the councils law enforcement contacts and taskforce members. Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, encourages council members to distribute the program and FAQs to anyone who would benefit or would be interested in applying. She announced that there is a call scheduled for individuals with questions upon reviewing the guidance and that information had been sent out as well.
 - **Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair,** announced that this information can be found on the meeting materials of the GOYFF website, on the DEMA website, or through email after inquiring to the GOYFF staff for this information.
- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair,** stated that there is no end date, each grantee will have a \$500,000 limit, and that the legislation requires the application to have a law enforcement partner.
 - **Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair,** clarified that only county, town, and city law enforcement agencies are eligible. This including prosecution and parole.
- Jennifer Crawford asked Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, if the applicant will have to provide an itemized list explaining what the money will be for or if can it be more general?
 - **Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair,** explained that GOYFF or the Arizona Human Trafficking Council does not run the funds. She suggests to join the call scheduled for later this month with DEMA to get an accurate answer as that is DEMAs purview. She encourages local partnership but emphasizes that the law enforcement agency is the applicant and subsequent grantee.

Coordinated Efforts to Secure The United States' Southern Border

- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, introduced Director Tim Roemer to speak on the ongoing coordinated efforts to secure the United States' southern border.
- **Director Tim Roemer** is the Director of the Arizona Department of Homeland Security, serves as the State's Chief Information Security Officer (CISO), and sits on the Arizona Human Trafficking Council. Director Roemer advises the Governor on a wide range of topics including cybersecurity, border security, and counterterrorism.
- Director Tim Roemer began by recognizing the efforts of the state, under Governor Doug Ducey's leadership and the Arizona legislature, to take action to help protect human life on the border, in the state, and in the nation. He thanked DEMA for undertaking this process and the legislature for providing these funds to secure the border, emphasizing that border security is not about immigration, but rather protecting human life. He applauded the council's leadership for taking the time to visit the border over the years because he notices something different everytime. With these visits, Director Tim Roemer stated that he is able to witness the current threats to the vulunerable individuals who are crossing the border every day.
- Director Tim Roemer stated that the number one challenge is educating and informing those on the border, or those who speak on the border publicly, to understand the differences between human smuggling and

human trafficking. Specfically that the human smuggling can lead to human trafficking when they enter into the country.

- Director Tim Roemer explained that 2022 will be another record breaking year on the border with two
 million apprehensions on the southwest border and over a half of a million in Arizona alone. Approximately,
 two individuals a day lose their life on the southern border due to the journey to get there being extremely
 dangerous. A large portion of the resources on the border (i.e. the National Guard) partake in rescue
 operations for those who have been lost or left behind on the way. Director Tim Roemer emphasized that
 this is a humanitarian issue and is working to get others to understand this perspective.
- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, thanked Director Tim Roemer for his efforts on educating individuals on the differences between human smuggling and human trafficking, and asked if he is able to see an increase in the awareness of the differences between human smuggling (transportation of people) and human trafficking (exploitative)?
 - **Director Tim Roemer** replied that he does think we are taking a step in the right direction, but difficulties arise when the state is experiencing record breaking years and there are misunderstandings and miscommunication that limits the resource capability to do proactive work or investigations. **Director Tim Roemer** stated that announcing a border crisis issue should be made without it becoming a political statement in order to have services and funding available.
 - Director Tim Roemer stated that on average, it costs approximately \$10,000 per person per trip to be able to cross the border. If these individuals do not have \$10,000, likely pathways are, but not limited to, forced labor, sex trafficking, or endentured servivitude once they make it into the country. This is where the intersection between human smuggling and human trafficking can present itself.
- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, requested clarification in regards to the two individuals dying everyday, asking if this statistic is national or Arizona-specific.
 - Director Tim Roemer relayed that the statistic refers to the southwest border, stating it is difficult to find representative statistics on migrant deaths because it is not known when or how these people died upon finding their skeletol remains. According to data gathered from fiscal year (FY) 2021 there were approximately 750 migrant deaths on the border. However, this statistic may not be representative of every death as it is dependent on finding the remains.
- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, requested for Director Tim Roemer to discuss the number of people crossing the border from year after year, asking specifically about volume and locations (i.e. Yuma, Arizona).
 - **Director Tim Roemer** discussed that Yuma has the highest spike in any sector of border patrol across the southwest border. He explained that Arizona has two sectors: Tucson and Yuma. Tucson is much larger in miles comparatively, and in years past, Tucson normally sees the largest number of apprehensions. He stated the Tucson sector sees more single adults, "get aways", and those who are trying to evade law enforcement. Yuma is currently seeing family units and "give ups." **Director Tim Roemer** stated that give ups are overwhelming the system and the border, and emphasized that when overwhelmed in one area, the most dangerous individuls, drugs, or criminal activity are run through that area.
 - Director Tim Roemer explained from a volume stand point, they are seeing on average, between 1,500 and 2,000 apprehensions a day in Arizona alone. Some days, the Yuma sector is seeing anywhere from 1,000 to 1,500 a day.
 - Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, commends Director Tim Roemer's efforts to separate the two issues of human smuggling and human trafficking, stating it is not just an issue regarding semantics, but rather something that is taking away resources from victims when they are thought of as the same issue.
 - **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair,** noted that the Super Bowl will serve as a catalyst for everyone to do their jobs, it is not a cause. She continued to provide anecdotal information regarding how some elected officials still get this terminology wrong, adding to the confusion.
- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, thanked Director Tim Roemer for taking the time to speak to the council.

Workgroup Updates

- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, stated that Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz is not present and suggests that the Workgroup Updates be moved ahead of schedule to accommodate for Alec Thompson's, LAVIDGE, arrival and in person presentation.
- Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, introduced Dr. Sarah Beaumont, Co-Chair of the Victim Services Workgroup, and asked if there are any updates.
 - Dr. Sarah Beaumont, Co-Chair of the Victim Services Workgroup, stated members of the workgroup have not had a chance to meet since the last Arizona Human Trafficking Council Meeting and there is nothing new to share with the council.

SuperBowl Update

- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, discussed she has been working with Director Debbie Johnson over the last year regarding the Super Bowl. They have partnered with the Super Bowl Host Commitee and is working heavily with Director Debbie Johnson and the Arizona Human Trafficking Council. The Super Bowl Host Commitee has shown tremendous support towards having a platform to be able to emphasize education and awareness of human trafficking in the state of Arizona. Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, is grateful for their partnership and efforts in this arena.
- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, stated that the Arizona Human Trafficking Council has also partnered with the U.S. Department of Homeland Security (DHS) and their Blue Campaign. She informed the council that the Blue Campaign materials are now co-branded with the Arizona Human Trafficking Council logo.
 - Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, held up two examples of the co-branded materials to the council. These materials are not intended to be distributed until its official launch in December 2022.
 - Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, explained that these materials are not Super Bowl specific and that they can always be used. She discussed the partnership with Alec Thomson, LAVIDGE, and how they have worked together to determine how they are going to push out materials.
 - Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, explained that the Blue Campaign has provided a variety of materials including a small and large poster (in English and Spanish), brochures, indicator cards, and key cards. She mentioned that there will be a distribution plan, however, it is still being determined who all will take this materials. She requested council members to be cognizant of those who would benefit from having these materials.
- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, introduced Alec Thomson, LAVIDGE, to discuss the Anti-Human Trafficking Media Campaign.
- Alec Thomson is the Multicultural and Public Service Marketing Director for LAVIDGE marketing agency, where he supports clients in developing impactful public education campaigns that drive meaningful impact across diverse communities and languages. Prior to joining LAVIDGE, Alec worked for over a decade in public service roles, including nearly three years as part of the Ducey Administration.
- Alec Thomson began his presentation by thanking the co-chairs of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council for their partnership on the campaign. He stated that he and his team at LAVIDGE learned a great deal about the issue of human trafficking in the state of Arizona.
- Alec Thomson stated the message of "Arizona does not tolerate human trafficking" has been at the forefront of this campaign since the beginning. This led to increased collaboration with law enforcement and other partners to inform the agency where there is more or less activity of trafficking in order to create a well-informed media campaign targeting both human and labor trafficking. Alec Thomson reiterated the Super Bowl and other large events serve as a catalyst for this media campaign, noting the biggest value is that people are coming to Arizona from all over the country and being exposed to this messaging at most major airports.
 - **Alec Thomson** showed examples of the co-branded materials, made to be clear that this is a State of Arizona and Arizona Human Trafficking Council initiative.

- **Alec Thomson** stated that the media campaign will launch December 8th, 2022 and run though February 26th, 2022. In March, analytics will be reviewed to determine which tactics worked best and where. This will inform the decision to continue the campaign and continue receiving funding.
- Alec Thomson discussed which methods will be deployed throughout the campaign. Those being static and digital billboards, gas station screens, mall restrooms, bar restrooms, lottery screens, social media (targeted towards teenagers), targetting pornogrpahy related sites / searches, and geofencing.
 - Alec Thomson stated that geofencing targeted ads may be more effective than most other methods due to the fact that links are embedded and can cut down on the time needed to reach those resources as they do not need to be remembered or written down.
- Alec Thomson stated this messaging is important and that additional funding will be imperative to continue.
- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, explained that the campaign would not be possible
 without the help the fellow state agencies including the Department of Child Safety (DCS), Department of
 Health Services (DHS), Department of Economic Security (DES), and Arizona Office of Tourism. DHS also
 agreed to print Blue Campaign materials for free, allowing for more money to be invested into a more robust
 media campaign that will also serve to identify metrics of success or needed areas of intervention which will
 inform the campaign going forward and the continuation of dollars put forth.
- Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, expanded upon the need for consistency and continuity of this messaging as DHS has edited and improved their materials. She stated that her and other council members have advocated for agencies to discontinue the use of any Super Bowl identifiers to enforce that this state is taking this issue seriously, every day of the year. Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, clarified that since the last council meeting, the Phoenix Airport has now agreed to train the 850 local on-site employees with the Blue Lightning Ciriculum. They have also committed to putting Blue Campaign materials up on their digital billboards as well as refreshing the bathroom signs. She stated that the deciding factor was that the council was pushing a government, a DHS entity's message. Phoenix would not accept a private sector message or a non-profit message.
- Jeramia Garcia Ramadan (Proxy for Director Wisehart) asked what the best way to amplify this message would be.
 - Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, stated that she will send an email detailing the materials and amount that can be distributed. Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, added that the council can provide digital versions of the campaign to distribute.
- Brian Steele commends the council for putting this campaign together and asked where a network of non-profits can get access to these materials to share out.
 - Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, relayed the digital images will be sent to everyone on the council. Alec Thomson added they are in the process of building a tool kit in conjunction with GOYFF that will include all social media assets.
 - **Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair,** stated council members will have physical copies for distribution at the next council meeting so that everyone will have them before Human Trafficking Awareness Month recognized in January.
 - Brian Steele commented that having tool kits for faith-based partners will be instrumental.
- **Jill Rable** asked if the campaign will be pushed to agencies and nonprofits that will feel the higher volume? If so, what is the council doing to prepare these agencies for the volume?
 - Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, supplemented the question, adding the prevention aspect. Individuals may not be aware of the vulnerabilities and things to avoid, and this will help prevent a lot of people from becoming a victim. She added that the council is working with agencies to help amplify the ability to respond to calls. This is something that will be built as the grows.
- Jill Rable asked how much effort is being put into developing and implementing 101s / trainings.
 - Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair, reiterated that reaching out to state agencies and fostering prevention is essential, adding that there will be training for health care workers and the 5,000 Super Bowl volunteers. She stated that they will continue with the trainings developed through the McCain Institute and there is room for everyone's own agencies to amplify this message.

- **Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair,** disccused how with the use of DEMA funds, GOYFF has been able to allocate money for the continuation and amplification of this message topurposely try to educate, promote, and influence that this state investment is aligned with the needs of Arizona. For example, victim-centered law enforcement response.
- Brian Steele commented that during the last Super Bowl, there was not an increase in trafficking, but rather an increase in reporting, noting that there is a lot of collaboration and communication. One aspect that was not present at the last Super Bowl was an aggressive prevention and awareness campaign.
 - **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair,** emphasized the importance of the coordination among the service providers and law enforcement, and when there is a lack of coordination, the victims are likely to suffer in the short-term and long-term.
 - Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, stated that she hopes that this campaign will educate and encourage individuals to become advocates, and continue spreading the message of preventing, idenitifying, and supporting victims.

Workgroup Updates

• Executive Director Maria Christina Fuentes, Co-Chair, stated that Director Debbie Johnson is no longer present at the meeting and no update is given.

Upcoming Meeting

• Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, reminded council members to mark their calendars for the next meeting on December 8th, at 10:00 am. The meeting will be held in person at the Executive Tower.

Adjournment

- Executive Director Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair, thanked everyone for being part of the meeting and asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting.
 - Keith Moffitt (Proxy for Director Faust) moved to adjourn the meeting.
 - Teresa Aseret-Manygoats (Proxy for Director Herrington) seconded the motion.
 - The meeting adjourned at 10:17 a.m.

Dated 24 of October 2022 Arizona Human Trafficking Council Respectfully Submitted By: Amy Peep GOYFF