



Arizona Human Trafficking Council
September 20, 2023, 9:00 AM
Hybrid Meeting

1700 West Washington Street, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

A general meeting of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council was convened on **September 20, 2023**,
notice having been duly given.

Members Present (13)	Members Absent (9)
Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair	Maria Cristina Fuentes, Co-Chair
Lt. Nicholas Alamshaw	Nathaniel Brown
Dr. Sarah Beaumont	Sarah Chung
Doug Coleman	Lt. Rick Leyvas
Maj. Jennifer Borquez (Proxy for Col. Jeffrey Glover)	Lois Lucas
Tonya Hamilton	David Lujan
Steve Selover (Proxy for Joseph Kelroy)	Sophia Philis-Ortiz
Rachelle Lumppp	T.J. Shope
Sara Micflikier (Proxy for Rachel Mitchell)	Jim Waring
Capt. Andrew Orozco	
Jill Rable	
Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz	
Brian Steele	
Staff and Guests Present (8)	
Amy Peep, GOYFF	Noelle Jensen, Speaker
Emily Uline-Olmstead, GOYFF	Ezequiel Dominguez, Speaker
Shayne Johnson, GOYFF	Alicia Winchel, Speaker
	Betty Caratachea, Speaker
	Mario Ramirez, Speaker

Call to Order

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, called the Arizona Human Trafficking Council meeting to order at **09:04 AM** with 13 members and eight staff/guests present. She reviewed meeting procedures, welcomed all those joining via Zoom, and thanked them for their flexibility.

Approval of Minutes

- With the quorum met, **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, requested a review of the **June 15, 2023** meeting minutes.
 - **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** moved to accept the **June 15, 2023** minutes.
 - **Brian Steele** seconded the motion.
- The motion passed with no dissenting votes at **09:09 AM**.

2023 Arizona Anti-Trafficking Efforts: Major Events Report

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, updated the 2023 Arizona Anti-Trafficking Efforts: Supporting Arizonans to Combat Human Trafficking (Major Events) Report. The comprehensive document is complete, and will send a copy to Council members.

Arizona Labor Trafficking Laws

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, introduced **Noelle Jensen** to give an overview of the Arizona Labor Trafficking laws.
 - **Noelle Jensen** has been a prosecutor in Pima County for nearly ten years. She spent 9.5 years with the [Pima County Attorney's Office](#), specializing in prosecuting sex offenders and domestic violence abusers. She recently joined the [Attorney General's Office](#) in the Southern Arizona White Collar and Criminal Enterprise section, where she continues to hold sex offenders accountable through her work on Internet Crimes Against Children (ICAC) cases and large-scale Fraud and Criminal Enterprise cases.
- **Noelle Jensen** began her presentation by explaining what labor trafficking is according to [U.S. Code 22 U.S.C. § 7102\(9\)](#) – The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA):
 - “The recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion subject to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.”
 - An estimated 27.6 million people globally are victims of forced labor in 2021:
 - 17.3 million are affected in the private sector (e.g., domestic work, manufacturing, construction, and agriculture).
 - 6.3 million are victims of commercial sexual exploitation.
 - 3.9 million imposed by the State.
- **Noelle Jensen** explained what labor trafficking is according to Arizona Law, [A.R.S. § 13-1308](#): Trafficking of Persons for Forced Labor or Services (Class 2 Felony).
 - It is unlawful for a person to *either* (both do not have to present):
 - Knowingly traffic another person with the intent to or knowledge that the other person will be subject to forced labor or services.
 - Knowingly benefit, financially or by receiving anything of value, from participation in a venture that has engaged in an act that violates § 13-1306, § 13-1307, this section, or § 13-3212(A)(9), or (10).
 - The definition of “Forced Labor or Services”:
 - Labor services that are performed or provided by another person and obtained through a person's either:
 - Causing or threatening to cause serious physical injury to any person.
 - Restraining or threatening to physically restrain another person.
 - Knowingly destroying, concealing, removing, confiscating, possessing, or withholding another person's actual or purported passport or other immigration document, government-issued identification document, government record, or personal property.
 - Abusing or threatening to abuse the law or the legal system.
 - Extortion.
 - Causing or threatening to cause financial harm to any person.
 - Facilitating or controlling another person's access to a controlled substance.

- Does not include ordinary household chores and reasonable disciplinary measures between a parent or legal guardian and the parent's or legal guardian's child.
- The definition of "Traffic":
 - "Traffic" means enticing, recruiting, harboring, providing, transporting, or obtaining another person by *deception*, coercion, or force.
 - Federal law includes fraud, and Arizona law includes *deception*. Arizona requires some form of harm that had been threatened or caused to the person.
 - [A.R.S. § 13-1306](#): Unlawfully Obtaining Labor Services - without force, fraud, and coercion.
 - [A.R.S. § 13-1307](#): Sex Trafficking.
 - [A.R.S. § 13-3212](#): Child Sex Trafficking.
- **Noelle Jensen** included other Arizona Laws related to labor trafficking and can be implicated.
 - [A.R.S. § 13-1303](#): Unlawful Imprisonment - knowingly restraining another person (misdemeanor).
 - [A.R.S. § 13-1304](#): Kidnapping - unlawful imprisonment, knowingly restraining another person, and something else (e.g., involuntary servitude).
 - [A.R.S. § 13-2312](#): Enterprise - commonly prosecuted at the Attorney General's Office. Through racketeering, someone has control of an enterprise illegally.
 - [A.R.S. § 13-2319](#): Human Smuggling - illegally bringing another person into the country. Labor trafficking does not require that element.
- **Noelle Jensen** provided a real-world example of Migrant Farm Workers in Georgia (2021). It was a multi-agency operation prosecuted by the U.S. Attorney's Office. Over \$200 million in profits, 100+ victims smuggled from Mexico and Central America, and the victims subjected to inhumane working conditions.
- **Noelle Jensen** mentioned that state prosecutors experience challenges, particularly with large-scale operations, such as securing witnesses, because these cases often cross State or international borders.
- **Noelle Jensen** finished her presentation by including what steps the Attorney General's office can take.
 - When prosecuting cases, focus on the financial aspects versus witness testimony.
 - Continuation of education/training.
 - Between January and August 2023, 551 7th to 12th-grade youth received training.
- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, asked about the number of labor trafficking prosecutions in Arizona.
 - **Noelle Jensen** responded she is unaware of any labor trafficking prosecutions and, currently, there are no active cases.
- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, asked if the training is labor trafficking specific.
 - **Rachelle Lumpp** responded the training focuses on sex trafficking but also includes elements of labor trafficking.
- **Tonya Hamilton** asked how long the training is.
 - **Rachelle Lumpp** responded the training is 60 to 90 minutes long (depending on the questions).
- **Steve Selover** asked how they conduct outreach to recruit the youth trained.
 - **Rachelle Lumpp** responded that the A.G.'s office does not actively reach out to schools; schools have contacted them expressing interest.
- **Brian Steele** asked what services are available to victims of labor trafficking specifically.
 - **Noelle Jensen** responded that she is unaware of anything specific to labor trafficking victims.
- **Brian Steele** asked if services are limited based on citizenship status.

- **Noelle Jensen** responded a victim's status is not asked and, therefore, is not a disqualifying attribute. She added the A.G.'s office does not help with obtaining visas.
- **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** commented that the victim compensation fund is unavailable for foreign-born victims.
- **Major Jennifer Borquez** asked if the training includes the Anti-Human Trafficking hotline (**1-877-4AZ-TIPS**).
 - **Rachelle Lumpp** responded yes.
- To view Noelle Jensen's presentation, click [here](#).

Project ALTO

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, introduced **Ezequiel Dominguez** to give an overview of Project ALTO and its efforts to support day laborers across the State.
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** is an Associate Director at [Arizona State University's Office of Sex Trafficking Intervention Research \(ASU STIR\)](#) and a second-year Ph.D. student in Social Work focusing on labor trafficking.
 - He leads Project Arizona Labor Trafficking Outreach (ALTO). He is an appointee to the City of Phoenix Human Trafficking Task Force.
 - Before academia, he served as Anti-Trafficking Programs Lead at Chicanos Por La Causa (CPLC) and is a graduate of the Human Trafficking Leadership Academy. Ezequiel is also a developing scholar with the Global Association of Human Trafficking Scholars.
- **Ezequiel Dominguez** began his presentation by giving a brief overview of Project ALTO, stating its purpose to emerge was due to the current landscape of labor trafficking in the State. The first duration of the Project occurred between September 2021 and April 2022, relaunching in April 2023, and has had five events thus far. Its mission is to support workers in Arizona by providing education on labor rights and increasing awareness of available community resources. Approximately 200-day laborers have received education and resources on their worker rights.
 - They also have several partners:
 - International Rescue Committee
 - Chicanos Por La Causa
 - Florence Project
 - Mexico Consulate in Phoenix
 - Arizona Legal Women and Youth Services
 - StretLight U.S.A.
 - Equal Employment Opportunity Commission
 - City of Phoenix
 - Arizona Anti-Trafficking Network
 - Arizona Attorney General's Office
 - Phoenix Dream Center
 - New Life Center
- **Ezequiel Dominguez** explained that Project ALTO focuses on day laborers due to the numerous hardships this population faces and is at an increased risk for street-level/workplace victimization.
 - They are referred to as "walking A.T.M.s" because it is common for these individuals to carry their earnings or keep them at home instead of in traditional banks.
 - The risk of being subject to the deportation threat dynamic is high. The mere perception of unauthorized legal status can trigger the Deportation Threat Dynamic, a cycle of exploitation wherein a migrant is stereotyped as "illegal" by an employer or criminal and subsequently

- victimized with the belief that the migrant will not file a police report due to fear of immigration-related consequences.
- In the workplace, wage theft, poor site conditions, and inconsistent transportation (to and from the job site) can happen.
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** shared an example of the project's outreach materials (slide 8). A list of worker rights includes a variety of resources (e.g., hotline numbers, legal services, and law enforcement) and are available in Spanish and English.
 - In total, Project ALTO has outreached approximately 250 day laborers; 60% of those individuals completed the survey. The current findings of the study:
 - The average age is 38.7, with a range of 16 to 69.
 - Mexico was the most common country of origin. Foreign-born people also reported being in the United States for approximately ten years (on average).
 - 89.4% of survey participants reported Spanish as their only language.
 - Almost 1 out of 4-day laborers reported being tricked into doing work different from what the employer originally told them.
 - About half of day laborers worked for little or almost no pay.
 - Almost 1 out of 10-day laborers report being threatened, harmed, or intimidated at work.
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** mentioned that it is necessary to distinguish between labor trafficking and non-labor trafficking situations.
 - Fair labor conditions: employment practices that uphold worker's rights (e.g., fair wages, reasonable work hours, safe working conditions).
 - Unfair labor conditions: interfering with an employee's right to unionize, transferring an employee to a different/less desirable job in retaliation to a complaint or grievance.
 - Labor violations: noncompliance with labor laws (e.g., failure to provide wages, improper record keeping, denial of rest periods, lack of safety measures taken).
 - Labor trafficking: all circumstances above could be considered labor trafficking. However, it requires the elements of force, fraud, and coercion.
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** continued his presentation by explaining how Project ALTO is looking to move forward. Overall, the project has been well-received, and they are working with other states that desire to replicate in their communities. Other items are listed below:
 - Develop a website with the intent to be a resource for laborers and community members to learn more about labor trafficking and get connected to resources tailored for victims and survivors.
 - Coordinate a pop-up drop-in center for migrant workers and the Latino community.
 - Subgrantee in Yuma to expand outreach to farm and agriculture workers.
 - Considering what other populations may benefit from this information.
 - **Brian Steele** commented that he has enjoyed being a partner of Project ALTO. Referring to the "walking A.T.M." description, had anyone called the police to report the crime? Are legal services provided on the outreach materials?
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** responded the deportation threat dynamic is commonly reported. Even if they are here lawfully, they try to minimize their presence. Overall, the need to collect nationwide data on this issue is critical. And yes, the "shoe card" lists [Project Arizona Legal Women and Youth Services \(ALWAYS\)](#) and the Florence Project.
 - **Sara Micflikier** commented that she recently referred a victim to ALWAYS. She asked where she could obtain flyers/resources for distribution.
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** stated they have plenty of show cards.

- **Rachelle Lumpp** asked if Project ALTO has noticed an improvement in the jobs that day laborers accept following outreach and education.
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** responded it is a complicated situation because employers are more likely to target laborers who are not asking questions or do not appear aware of their rights. Also, comparatively, they are making more money in the United States than in their country of origin.
- **Major Jennifer Borquez** asked if there is targeted outreach in border communities in the southern part of the State area due to the number of people coming across.
 - **Ezequiel Dominguez** responded they are working to expand outreach and find partners in southern Arizona.
- To view Ezequiel Dominguez's presentation, click [here](#).

Labor Trafficking Program | International Rescue Committee

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, introduced **Alicia Winchel** to give an overview of the [International Rescue Committee \(I.R.C.\)](#) and its specific programs to support victims of Labor Trafficking.
 - **Alicia Winchel** is the Anti-Trafficking and Victim Services Manager at Arizona's I.R.C. She provides program oversight and monitoring, staff supervision, and aids in developing community partnerships.
 - Alicia began at the I.R.C. as the Anti-Trafficking Caseworker. She became a dedicated advocate specializing in supporting foreign national victims of crime, specifically human trafficking.
- **Alicia Winchel** began her presentation by explaining the I.R.C. responds to the world's worst humanitarian crises and helps people survive, recover, and rebuild their lives. They restore safety, dignity, and hope to millions uprooted and struggling to endure.
 - Founded in 1933 at the request of Albert Einstein to aid refugees fleeing persecution and genocide in Europe. The [Phoenix office](#) opened in 1994, followed by the opening of the [Tucson office](#) in 1997.
- **Alicia Winchel** explained that the Arizona League to End Regional Trafficking (ALERT) is an anti-trafficking program that assists foreign national victims of human trafficking by providing comprehensive case management (social, legal, psychological/psychiatric, health/medical).
 - ALERT works with local law enforcement and the U.S. Department of Homeland Security to provide safety and security for identified victims.
 - ALERT served 70 foreign victims of trafficking in the state fiscal year 2022.
 - Since 2003, they have served 345 clients; of those, 148 were victims of labor trafficking, 40 were victims of sex trafficking, and 27 were victims of both sex and labor trafficking.
- **Alicia Winchel** explained the I.R.C. recently received two grants.
 - Office for Victims of Crime (OVC) Comprehensive Services: Funding will provide services to meet the individualized needs of victims of human trafficking; collaborate with and train local partners to ensure trafficking victims are correctly identified and referred for appropriate services; provide assistance or referrals to other essential services for victims of human trafficking; and collect data while additionally participating in assessment activities to determine if the program is meeting stated goals and objectives.
 - Provide services to any foreign national victim of human trafficking (sex or labor) regardless of age or gender.
 - Clients served since July 2023: 26
 - OVC Services to Minor Victims of Labor Trafficking: Funding will provide services to meet the individualized needs of minor victims of labor trafficking; collaborate with and train local partners to

ensure correct identification of trafficking victims and referred for appropriate services, provide assistance or referrals to other essential services for victims of human trafficking; and secure data collection while participating in evaluation activities to determine if the program meets state goals and objectives.

- They can provide services to any minor victim of labor trafficking (foreign or domestic). Also, if a victim is an adult but the trafficking occurred when they were a minor, they can provide services.
- Clients served since July 2023: 5
- **Alicia Winchel** stated I.R.C. is a proud partner of Project ALTO and is present at the outreach events to provide referrals if needed.
- **Alicia Winchel** explained activities the I.R.C. has completed and what they are focusing their efforts on.
 - Completed activities:
 - Provided labor trafficking training to the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) listserv.
 - Met with Tapestri, an organization in Georgia known for its outreach efforts to H2AH-2A Temporary Agricultural Workers.
 - Met with Southside Workers Center in Tucson to learn about outreach with day laborers.
 - Provided training to staff at Camelback High School on signs of labor trafficking for minors (upcoming: training parents and students).
 - Looking ahead:
 - Expand outreach to farm and agriculture communities.
 - Continue to educate the community on labor trafficking amongst minors.
 - Develop new strategies to reach and educate day laborers on labor rights and trafficking.
 - Find other organizations in Arizona that would like to partner to address labor trafficking.
- **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** and **Brian Steele** commented that they love the partnership with the I.R.C. and look forward to future opportunities.
- To view Alicia Winchel's presentation, click [here](#).

Labor Trafficking Program | Chicanos Por La Causa

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, introduced **Betty Caratachea** and **Mario Ramirez** to explain [Chicanos Por La Causa \(CPLC\)](#)'s Building Bridges to Hope program for victims of labor trafficking.
 - **Betty Caratachea** is a Program Manager for CPLC. She has 20 years of experience working with youth, families, and communities of varying cultures, socioeconomic status, and behavioral health conditions. She has experience providing services to high-risk populations such as those placed in the Arizona Department of Child Safety (DCS) services, those experiencing homelessness, domestic violence, incarcerated parent/family, teen parents, blended/multigenerational families, human trafficking, school behavioral/learning plans, mental/development issues, and crisis observation.
 - Ms. Caratachea manages two federally funded grants for Health and Human Services and the OVC about Human Trafficking. She provides program implementation, execution, and oversight to CPLC's Building Bridges to Hope: Comprehensive Case Management Program. She also manages a Homeless Street Youth Outreach Program in partnership with the Juvenile Probation Department at the Arizona Administrative Office of the Courts and the Arizona Department of Economic Security.

- **Mario Ramirez** is a Program Supervisor at CPLC. He has 13 years of experience working with at-risk populations of varying cultures, socioeconomic status, and behavioral and medical health as but not limited to DCS-involved youth, general care for youth, human trafficking, and crisis observation and clinical services.
 - Mr. Ramirez currently supervises CPLC's Building Bridges to Hope: Comprehensive Case Management Program for survivors of Human Trafficking, where he manages the Program Case Managers and Promotora, conducting Comprehensive Case Management services, outreach, and Community Education.
- **Betty Caratachea** began their presentation by explaining the [Building Bridges to Hope: Anti-Trafficking Initiative](#). They provide comprehensive case management, community education/training, and outreach.
 - *Comprehensive case management*: Providing participants with services to promote self-sufficiency, resiliency, and empowerment. Survivors learn to navigate and obtain needed services via adult skills training.
 - *Community education and training*: Human Trafficking 101 classes tailored to community providers (e.g., specific for the population served, such as LGBTQ+, males).
 - *Outreach*: Within the community at local events with other partners (e.g., Mexican Consultant, Catholic Charities, StreetLight U.S.A., I.R.C., and ASU STIR).
 - *Program eligibility*:
 - 18 years or older
 - Domestic or Foreign born
 - Resides in Arizona
 - Completes Screening assessment
 - Meets criteria as a victim/survivor of Sex or Labor Trafficking
 - They currently have 13 participants enrolled:
 - Ten participants were tricked/forced to perform work for money, drugs, protection, clothing, and shelter.
 - Six participants reported being promised work, but the work or payment result differed from what they expected.
 - Four participants had someone control the money they earned in exchange for drugs, food, shelter, clothing, or protection.
 - Three participants reported they were afraid to leave for fear of violence towards them or their families.
 - Participants reported being between 16 and 34 years old at the time of occurrence.
 - The trafficker's relationship with the victim was a significant other, a friend, a past significant other, or an unknown to the victim.
 - Victims reported being forced into sexualized labor, agriculture, childcare, and domestic servitude.
 - *Participant demographics were explained via graphs (slides 9-11)*
 - 31% of the participants reported having four adverse childhood experiences (A.C.E.s).
 - 93% of the participants said they had also been sex trafficked.
 - **Mario Ramirez** explained that CPLC had identified 494 victims of Labor Trafficking since the inception of services in October 2020 through outreach and referral. Although they did not all engage in enrollment of services, CPLC was able to educate them on their labor rights, provide pamphlets about their rights and CPLC's services, and provide them with general resources.
- **Mario Ramirez** mentioned CPLC's current referral sources/partners.

- CPLC Building Bridges to Hope Hotline
- Project ALTO
- EEOC
- Immigration Law Firms
- Project ALWAYS
- I.R.C.
- Catholic Charities
- Internal CPLC Programming
- ASU STIR
- **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** added that serving victims means identifying people with these needs, holding traffickers accountable, and preventing future victimizations.
- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, commented that this is the first labor trafficking-focused meeting. She stated that she is encouraged by the cooperation between the organizations at the Council meeting.
- **Sara Micflikier** stated she has experienced victims hesitant to continue pursuing charges, adding community partners serve to empower these victims, ensuring wraparound services and support.
- To view Betty Caratachea and Mario Ramirez's presentation, click [here](#).

Workgroup Updates

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, introduced the Data and Research Workgroup Chair, **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz**, to share updates with the Council.
 - **Dr. Dominique Roe-Sepowitz** reported the following:
 - ASU STIR has a new staff member who will act as the department's community liaison.
 - Upcoming training:
 - Training law enforcement in the West Valley (Goodyear, Avondale, Surprise, and Maricopa County Attorney's Office).
 - Quarterly Juvenile Probation Officers training.
 - Department of Child Safety worker training.
 - Training public defenders.
 - Since adding the hotline to the Estrella Jail screening process, 89 people have been flagged as potential victims.
 - There have been 69 calls to the Arizona Anti-Trafficking Hotline since February 1.
 - The 2023 Y.E.S. Survey is almost complete.
- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, introduced the Victim Services Workgroup Co-Chair, **Dr. Sarah Beaumont**, to share updates with the Council.
 - **Dr. Sarah Beaumont** reported the Victim Services Workgroup was able to meet since the last Council meeting to determine new goals and objectives, and discussed adding more individuals to expand diversity.
 - Establish a provider resource program.
 - Enhance connections.
 - Other resources (grants).

Anti-Human Trafficking Hotline Posters Available

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, encouraged Council Members to take the Anti-Human Trafficking Hotline Posters available outside the conference room; posters will be available following every Council meeting.

Upcoming Meeting

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, reminded members about the next meeting on **October 18, 2023, at 9:00 AM**. The meeting will be held in person at the Executive Tower and available in a hybrid platform for Council Members and the public to join virtually.

Adjournment

- **Claire Sechler Merkel, Co-Chair**, thanked everyone for being part of the meeting and asked for a motion to adjourn.
 - **Sara Micflikier** moved to accept the motion.
 - **Captain Andrew Orozco** seconded the motion.
- The motion passed with no dissenting votes at **11:00 AM**.

Dated September 21, 2023
Arizona Human Trafficking Council
Respectfully Submitted By:
Amy Peep
GOYFF