

Arizona Human Trafficking Council
October 29th, 2019, 9:00 a.m.
Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room

1700 West Washington Street, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

A general meeting of the Arizona Human Trafficking Council was convened on October 29th, 2019 at the Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room, 1700 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

Members Present (19)	Members Absent (6)
Cindy McCain Co-Chair	Brian Steele
Gil Orantia Co-Chair	Nathaniel Brown
Tom Salow (proxy for Cara Christ)	Doug Coleman
Dominique Roe-Sepowitz	Gary McCarthy
Tony Mapp (proxy for Frank Milstead)	James Gallagher
Heather Carter	James Waring
Jennifer Crawford	
Jill Rable	
Joseph Kelroy	
Kate Brophy McGee	
Lois Lucas	
Mike Faust	
Sarah Beaumont (by phone)	
Sarah Kent	
Sheila Polk	
Zora Manjencich	
Marsha Calhoun (by phone)	
Rachel Mitchell (by phone)	
Debbie Johnson (by phone)	
Staff and Guests Present (44)	
Nikki Green	Chris Glover
Maria C Fuentes	Melissa Diegel
Malcolm Hightower	Abby Schroeder
Stephanie Di Verde	Vienna Welch
Joanna Jauregui	Todd
Tonya Hamilton	Andrea Kader
Erin Galloway	Lisa Luchi
Nicole Valenzula	Michelle Racher
Sonya Pierce-Johnson	Edna Lugo
Princess Jennifer Lee	Stacey Sutherland
Holly Reynolds	Beth Breen
M. Sherwyn	Kristin Boorse

Veronica Duffield	Sr. Mary Angela Alexander
Shannon Henderson	Ezequiel Dominguez
Evelyn Keiling	Tyesha Wood
Josh Barrett	Bandak Leu
Gary Lopez	Claudia Letsie
Martin Linch	Mayra Lopez
Kristan Landry	CG Landry
Loraine Patterson	Dena Larsen
Lori Ford	Grumpy
Indy	Mykal Oshea

Call to Order

- **Mr. Gil Orrantia, Co-Chair**, called the Arizona Human Trafficking Council meeting to order at 9:05 a.m.

Welcome/Introductions

- **Mr. Orrantia, Co-Chair**, welcomed everyone and asked all members to introduce themselves, and welcomed new member Ms. Calhoun.

Approval of Minutes

- **Mr. Orrantia** requested a review of the **September 17th, 2019** meeting minutes.
 - **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** motioned to accept the **September 17th, 2019** minutes.
 - **Mr. Kelroy** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes.

Update from the National Center for Missing & Exploited Children on Human Trafficking Post Backpage and SESTA/FOSTA

- **Ms. Souras and Ms. Shehan** spoke regarding the year since Backpage was shut down. SESTA/FOSTA has had impacts regarding legal challenges and criminal prosecution. Since the shutdown of Backpage, cases that are very complicated and involved have come up. Two in particular were based out of Massachusetts and Florida, which involve child victims of sex trafficking. Soon after SESTA/FOSTA was enacted, a number of individuals sought to cease the implementation of the SESTA/FOSTA. There is no verdict on this case to date. Other cases were brought to light regarding a number of Jane Doe's that have been trafficked through Backpage and similar sites. Another case that has resulted involves criminal prostitution and the trial date is set for May 2020. Information from the cyber tip line has shown that the shutdown has affected the online marketplace. A number of sites have experienced an increase in demand. It is also shown that some sites, or sections of sites, have been shut down, as well as a change in domain name. Another impact shows that pictures featured on such sites are increasingly more exploitative. Such sites are also seemingly using less pictures of minors in their ads.

Dr. Roe-Sepowitz asked if there was a change in recruitment on these sites. **Ms. Souras and Ms. Shehan** explained that the data collected did not focus on this area. Recruitment methods have changed to include more mainstream sites/applications.

Mrs. McCain asked about the different domain names and how they can be monitored. **Ms. Souras and Ms. Shehan explained** that because of the nature of this technology, it is hard to follow up.

Ms. Kent asked if video games are moderated at all, as many children play video games with groups of peers. **Ms. Souras and Ms. Shehan** explained that it is absolutely a method they are seeing traffickers use. They also mentioned that this method is more popular among young boys, even though young girls may also be recruited in this way.

Update from Thorn on Human Trafficking Post Backpage

- **Ms. Boorse** gave a scatter shot of what happened since Backpage shutdown. She explained that nearly 40 other sites were shut down at the same time. This led to an increase in street trafficking due to the lack of online avenues. Additionally, other sites have been seen to be specific to certain geographic locations. Fortunately, as other sites attempted to meet the demands for financial gain they were not able to retain the demand, technology-wise. The data collected has shown a dramatic increase in duplicate ads. Sites are now implementing protective measures. Sites now require a login, captcha, or other protective factors. Data is now showing that only 25% of ads are unique. This makes it much harder to identify victims. Previously, Backpage accounted for the majority of ads, and now there are at least 9 sites that share the majority of sources.
Ms. Polk asked what the impact of taking down Backpage meant for traffickers/victims. **Ms. Boorse** explained that the online marketplace has rebounded. It is challenging to track because there are so many sites. Previously, ads were in “classified” sections, and now they are seen in the more mainstream sites.
Ms. Crawford stated that in her work, she is seeing a lot of movement on many different sites. When they place an ad on one site, soon after, they are seeing the same ad on different sites. **Ms. Boorse** explained that this happens because sites will share ads with their sister sites.
Dr. Roe-Sepowitz asked if the nearly 40 other sites were shut down because they were under Backpage.
Ms. Boorse explained that it is believed that Backpage had many sister sites.

Pima County Anti-Trafficking Efforts

- **Det. Crawford** explained that SAATURN, which stands for “Southern Arizona Anti-Trafficking Unified Response Network”, was under a 3 year grant, which was granted an extension, but ended in March 2019. Because of a shift in the scope of work, most cases thus far are reactive. They get called to hotels, regarding domestic violence issues, or tips from Polaris and NCMEC. Outreach has not diminished, even though the grant ended. Outreach efforts still include: education for parents, tabling events, radio shows (monthly), and new programs specific to detained female juveniles. A new support group, under the advisement of CODAC and a licensed therapist will be introduced to select group homes. This will help develop healthy relationships. **Det. Crawford** expressed that thankfully, there is still a lot of interest in the issue even as the grant has ended.
Mr. Kelroy asked about males in detention. He said Pima offers community events, social services, law enforcement etc. **Det. Crawford** explained that the program only focuses on females at the moment, but the intention is to include the male population eventually.

Estrella Project

- **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz**, along with **Capt. Jennifer Perks** and **Gary Lopez, Head of the Mosaic Project**, explained that the Estrella Project focuses on tackling human trafficking from an innovative perspective. The Estrella Project focuses on prevention, protection and education for detained females. It is the responsibility of the project to identify victims as they don’t always self-identify. It is important that victims know they are safe and they have access to resources. Mosaic is a 7 week substance abuse program during their sentence. Participation is court ordered, and participants are released upon completion. Their partners make sure the participants have the resources they need upon release.
During the STAR intervention (Sex Trafficking Awareness and Recovery), participants, perhaps for the first time, are introduced to the definition of human/sex trafficking. Previously, the women often did not realize they were victims. The program enables a safe place for asking questions. Trauma symptoms which are detrimental to everyday functionality, are presented and explained. They learned through this program that there is a lack of understanding about the definitions of human trafficking. Barriers identified include the lack of support systems upon release. The project works to close the gaps on the links to services including release plans, appropriate clothing, sufficient funds, information and release time (of day).
Ms. Polk asked why it is that when participants’ sentences have ended, and they are released into probation, they don’t have case management. **Capt. Perks** explained that the release plans are complicated, due to the high risk nature of the victim. Victims are not always motivated to change, and they struggle with compliance. **Mr. Lopez** said there is difficulty with support after release.

Sen. Brophy McGee asked if substance abuse education was provided. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** explained that sources are limited and the project aims to fill the gap in services to make sure resources are in place upon release.

Ms. Rable asked what the ideal number per group or over the course of the program is. **Dr. Roe-Sepowitz** explained that the cohorts have been averaging 15 participants, with varied ages, which lends to different experiences. The ideal size is between 11 and 15 participants. If that trend continues for the future implementations, it will bring the program to about 100 participants. They will work with the victims to help them find resources.

Future Meeting Dates

- The next Arizona Human Trafficking Council will meet on December 4th, 2019, at 9 a.m.

Call to the Public

- **Co-Chair Gil Orrantia** gave call to the public.
- Dr. Princess Jennifer Lee: Sex, human and organ trafficking in the US, Nigeria, and globally.
- Kristan Landry: Missing children
- Talnee Gonzales: Abuse of state
- Melissa Diegal: Human trafficking through medical kidnapping
- Shannon Henderson: AZ DCS
- Beth Breen: Missing children
- Martin Lynch: Due process
- Lori Ford: Human trafficking
- Dewitt Page Hoops Jr: child sex trafficking
- David Jose Romero: Laws of CPS and guardian ad litem
- Lorraine Patterson: Sex trafficking

Adjourn

- **Chairman Gil Orrantia** called for adjournment at 11:01 a.m.
Dr. Roe-Sepowitz motioned to accept
Ms. Crawford seconded the motion
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes.

Dated 29 of October 2019
Arizona Human Trafficking Council
Respectfully Submitted By:
Nikki Green
GOYFF