



Commission
to Prevent Violence
Against Women

Arizona Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women

August 15, 2019, 10:00 a.m.

Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room

1700 W. Washington, PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

A general meeting of the Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women was convened on August 15, 2019, at the Governor's 2nd Floor Conference Room at 1700 W. Washington, Phoenix, Arizona 85007, notice having been duly given.

Members Present (16)	
Diane Umphress, Chair	
Kate Brophy McGee, Co-Chair	
Mark Klym (Proxy for Susan Smith)	
Beth Hoel	
Jon Eliason	
Barbara Marshall (Proxy for Elizabeth Ortiz)	
Neil Websdale	
Patricia Klahr	
Laura Guild	
Kirstin Flores	
Steven Stahl	
Patricia George	
Monica Yelin (on the phone)	
Jon Smith (on the phone)	
Ed Mercurio-Sakwa (on the phone)	
Kay Radwanski (on the phone)	
Staff/Guests Present (23)	Members Absent (5)
Rebecca Chesley	Tasha Menaker
Sonya Pierce-Johnson	Daniel Rincon
Malcolm Hightower	Jason Zimmerman
Gaelyn Davis	Nicole Bidwill
Joanna Jaugueri	Eve Scarff
Nikki Green Lazarus	
Stephanie Di Verdi	
Terrilyn Miller	
Jennifer Jermaine	
Erica McFadden	
Sarah Ruf	
Laura Graham	

Christa Isom	
Kennesha Jackson	
Terrilyn Miller	
Kacie Kliebert	
Kate Chisholm	
Wayne Warrington	
Gabrielle Stacey	
Gwen Ruiz	
Malinda Sherwyn	
Felicia Chew	
Patricia Cummins	

Call to Order

- **Ms. Diane Umphress, Chair**, called the Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women meeting to order at 10:09 a.m. with 16 members and 23 staff and guests present.

Welcome/Introductions

- **Ms. Diane Umphress, Chair**, welcomed everyone, and asked all members to introduce themselves, including those that had called in.

Approval of Minutes

- **Ms. Diane Umphress, Chair**, requested a review of the **May 16, 2019** meeting minutes.
 - **Commissioner Steve Stahl motioned** to accept the **May 16, 2019** minutes.
 - **Commissioner Jon Eliason** seconded the motion.
 - The motion passed with no dissenting votes. Senator Kate Brophy McGee stated she was absenting because she was not present at last meeting.

The Silent Epidemic: Responding to sexual assault among people with intellectual and developmental disabilities

- **Dr. Erica McFadden** was introduced by **Ms. Diane Umphress, Chair**.
- **Dr. Erica McFadden**, from the Arizona Developmental Disabilities Planning Council (ADDPC), presented on responding to sexual assault among people with intellectual and developmental disabilities in Arizona. **Dr. Erica McFadden** gave an overview of the Arizona Developmental Disabilities Planning Council and their work with collecting data, collaborating with both public and private sectors, funding grants, advancing community inclusion, and promoting self-advocacy. **Dr. Erica McFadden** addressed the prevalence of abuse, stating the Bureau of Justice Statistic on National Crime Victimization Survey that women with cognitive disabilities are 12 times more likely to be sexually assaulted than others. **Dr. Erica McFadden** also stated that people with disabilities are 3 times more likely to be victims of violent crime, with 40% being by someone they knew well. In addition, **Dr. Erica McFadden** stated that 70% of people with disabilities reported abuse, with 87.2% of abuse being verbal/emotional, 50.6% being physical, 41.6% being sexual, 37.3% being neglect and 31.5% being financial abuse. It was stated that 90% of victims report on multiple occasions, 57% are abused on more than 20 occasions and 46% said it was too many times to count. **Dr. Erica McFadden** discussed the differences of sexual abuse prevalence by type of disability. **Dr. Erica McFadden** presented on the crisis at Hacienda HealthCare. Her agency issued

a report containing recommendations to prevent sex abuse among people with disabilities. **Dr. Erica McFadden** stated that some of these measures are gaining traction in the Arizona Legislature. **Dr. Erica McFadden** discussed how the Hacienda Healthcare Crisis allowed for deeper examination into the prevalence and possibilities of abuse in intermediate health centers. **Dr. Erica McFadden** discussed that people with disabilities often have blurred boundaries early in life based on the needs and level of assistance that is required. As such, the disabled community is often done a disservice because they are not viewed as sexual beings and are therefore targeted. Another concern that **Dr. Erica McFadden** brought attention to was the lack of credibility that some reports had from a person with a disabilities

- **Dr. Erica McFadden** examined the Executive Order for Preventing Abuse that Governor Ducey issued on February 6, 2019. This EO aims to enhance protections for individuals with disabilities. **Dr. Erica McFadden** discussed that some of the legislation change includes requiring initial abuse, neglect, and exploitation training annually for all Division of Developmental Disabilities staff, requiring reporting APS data to the public, and license Healthcare Intermediate Care Facilities for Individuals with an Intellectual Disability or Related Condition (ICF/IID). While annual training is mandatory, there is still disagreement and pushback on posting requirements and training for people with disabilities on how and when to report abuse. It is in the works that all 11 state operated ICF/IIDs are being licensed and there is a move to ensure alignment across the 3 state agencies. **Dr. Erica McFadden** reported that 11 bills have been passed this year on abuse and neglect.
- **Dr. Erica McFadden** presented on the Governor's Abuse/Neglect Prevention Task Force Collaboration in which multiple agencies are involved with self-advocating for individuals and families. **Dr. Erica McFadden** discussed the risk of retraumatizing families and individuals who are a part of the task force, which has allowed the task force to connect them to resources. **Dr. Erica McFadden** stated ACESDV was a large contributor to resources that were given. **Dr. Erica McFadden** stated that recommendations from the Task Force will be made public in October. **Dr. Erica McFadden** informed the Commission that Funding for Research was granted 7/1/19 for sexual violence research. **Dr. Erica McFadden** also informed the commission that there would be an informational course on October 12, 2019 from 1:00pm-3:00pm about talking to your children about sexuality. This training is specifically for people or parents of people with developmental disabilities to examine barriers of talking about sexuality, gain knowledge about disabilities, and acquire and practice skills in communicating about sexuality with young and grown children. **Dr. Erica McFadden** spoke to the concept of creating a culture of awareness. **Dr. Erica McFadden** discussed ADDPC's next steps in having a sex abuse roundtable, gaining support with federal funding for APS programs, ensuring DD populations are included in ACEs trainings, and that in-house reports are completed.
- **Ms. Diane Umphress, Chair** commented that numerous victims that have disabilities have come to her organization, Amberley's Place, and that it has proven to take longer to gain the full story or report during a more delicate investigation from these persons. **Ms. Diane Umphress, Chair** stated that training is vital for these delicate investigations and encouraged **Dr. Erica McFadden** to invite family advocacy centers to collaborate with research and data collection. **Dr. Erica McFadden** asked **Ms. Diane Umphress** if family advocacy centers would allow for victims to come even years after an incident for help. **Ms. Diane Umphress** confirmed that assistance can be provided after and that the family advocacy centers are there to help the victim make an educated decision.
- **Mr. Jon Eliason** discussed that the same standards of evidence exist for cases that involve abuse of a person with disabilities and that family advocacy centers serve as a great start for treatment and care.

- **Mr. Steven Stahl** stated that all interviews are audio and video recorded as the person is telling their story in order to help limit the amount of retraumatization that could happen from having to retell the story later.
- **Senator Kate Brophy McGee** requested more information on reported camp counselors not facing repercussions or prosecution following reported incidences. **Dr. Erica McFadden** stated that there is still a problem with people being able to jump around to different jobs and facilities without repercussions of previous offences due to difficulties that exist in the central registry. **Dr. Erica McFadden** stated that by the time that the process is complete only 3% of cases are substantiated and that the database search is time consuming which makes it complicated for people who are hiring large quantities of employees. Another issue that exists with the database is that it does not inform you of how many incidences a person has on their record. **Mr. Jon Eliason** reaffirmed the importance of reporting for repeated offenders. **Ms. Patricia Klahr** discussed the need to see the continuation if someone is a reoffender and that the databases need to find a way to collaborate and work together.
- **Dr. Erica McFadden** voiced concerns that people often also have a difficult time reporting to police, even if the police are disguised or in common clothing like at family advocacy centers. **Mr. Steven Stahl** discussed appropriate tracking often requires a report to the police. Reporting to family advocacy centers involves incident and abuse documents, and aids in the multidisciplinary approach that help with successful adjudication. **Mr. Steven Stahl** also spoke about having those that interview people be trained on how to handle and approach cases with victims that have intellectual disabilities. **Mr. Steven Stahl** specifically spoke to a 30-minute video that has been used and created by an officer who has children with special needs. **Dr. Erica McFadden** elaborated that people can be at different points of reporting the abuse. **Ms. Diane Umphress** clarified that at centers you are not pressured to make a report unless under 18 and a person is legally mandated to do so. **Ms. Diane Umphress** also pointed out the importance of accessibility when reporting, as seen with a satellite center that was created, in which reports increased by 115% because people felt they had sufficient access resources. **Mr. Jon Smith** further clarified that mandated reporting is sometimes also legally required for adults based on the level of disability. **Mr. Jon Smith** spoke on training mandated reporters on abuse and how to handle special cases.
- **Mr. Neil Websdale** reviewed his own work and research and encouraged **Dr. Erica McFadden** to contact him to arrange the creation of a video to go on the national website for helping with training.

Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women

- **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** presented on the progress of tribal nations' investigations of missing indigenous women. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** began by informing the Commission that 4 out of 5 indigenous women will be assaulted in their lifetime. A current problem with the electronic database is that many tribal nations only have records back to 2015. Additionally, there is frequent contention over whether or not the missing women have left of their own free will or if they have actually gone missing. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** stated the work that she is doing, including focusing on creating prevention campaigns, working on database recovery, and meeting with tribal nations. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** reported that out of the 17 nations that she has met with so far, only 7 have full access to see if someone has an order of protection. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** spoke to how she is working to clear red tape that exists in tracking perpetrators once they are on tribal lands. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** discussed that coordinating with victim advocates was very important and that she is working on increasing training for culturally appropriate responses with several community organizations, including working

with dentists on training to recognize and report signs of domestic violence. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** read the membership list for a new Task Force focused on these concerns. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** stated that it was the hope of the Task Force to produce a report to tribal nations with data they are currently missing by November 2020.

- **Ms. Diane Umphress** encouraged **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** to work on collaboration with the reservations near Yuma. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** discussed how there were several tribes that she was able to contact that had extended borders, like the Pascua Yaqui, whose tribe extends into Mexico and allows extradition treaties.
- **Ms. Diane Umphress** discussed how the standards and expectations for abuse in the Tribal communities need to change. **Representative Jennifer Jermaine** agreed and stated that this is the primary focus of the Task Force is prevention campaigns.
- **Mr. Neil Websdale** discussed the Indian country homicide review team that occurs in Montana on which he serves. **Mr. Neil Websdale** stated that he would put them in contact with Representative Jermaine.
- **Mr. Jon Eliason** discussed the Maricopa county unit that is tasked full time with creating comprehensive databases on cold cases. **Mr. Jon Eliason** invited Rep. Jermaine to attend a training that was being held August 26-28th to learn about the techniques being used to solve these cases.

Lighting Arizona Purple Plans

- **Ms. Rebecca Chesley** gave an overview of plans for Domestic Violence Awareness Month. **Ms. Rebecca Chesley** stated that the kick-off event for the 5th Annual- Statewide Domestic Violence Awareness Event was going to be Tuesday, October 1, 2019 from 6:00pm to 7:00pm at the Arizona State Capital House Lawn. **Ms. Rebecca Chesley** also presented information on an upcoming webinar on August 20th. **Ms. Rebecca Chesley** stated that there would also be a Faith Community Roundtable on October 29th in Flagstaff, AZ. Partnerships for Lighting Arizona Purple were listed as Home Depot, who would be providing purple light bulbs and displays in 50+ stores and PetSmart Charities, who has helped create a downloadable toolkit and is the leading sponsor of the Capitol Event. **Ms. Rebecca Chesley** listed other community partnerships that will be participating in Lighting Arizona purple and issued a call for statewide engagement. **Ms. Rebecca Chesley** has been encouraging and reaching out to local areas in the state to do similar events in their communities.
- **Ms. Diane Umphress** talked about the purple ribbon magnetics that are used on police cars and given to all officers in Yuma.

Subcommittee Reports

- **Outreach and Awareness Committee**
 - **Mr. Steve Stahl** reported on the most recent subcommittee meeting in which the subcommittee discussed Lighting Arizona Purple coordination and event logistics. **Mr. Steve Stahl** also reported that he will be having a meeting next week with Superintendent Hoffman to gain support for Maricopa Association of Government and prevention education in schools. **Mr. Steve Stahl** expressed that it was his goal to work with the superintendent in order to gain top-down approval for programs, like Bloom365 which has gone into schools previously.
- **Victim Services Committee**

- **Ms. Diane Umphress, Chair** reported that the committee recently reviewed the STOP Grant implementation to identify statewide needs and will work to identify gaps in services . The next meeting will be November 7th.
- **Training and Prevention Committee**
 - **Mr. Jon Eliason** reviewed goals of the subcommittee to partner on training that is currently out and working with groups to assist with new changes in protective orders.

Request for Future Presentation Topics

- **Diane Umphress, Chair** opened the conversation to discuss possible future topics to bring to the Commission meetings. **Mr. Steve Stahl** suggested that the Arizona Criminal Justice Commission provide a presentation on their pilot program and where the commission can assist. **Mr. Neil Websdale** discussed the National Crime Institute in Portland which is working to bring technology to rural areas to give victims a portal to create a petition from laptops in community health centers or family advocacy centers. Logistics about this interface were discussed, including that victims are more likely to provide more detail which is helpful for legal proceedings. **Mr. Jon Eliason** suggested having an expert to report on the homeless women's population and how domestic violence relates to homelessness. It was also suggested that the Commission request a speaker who can report on domestic violence- related suicide and opioid addiction.

Future Meeting Dates

- **Diane Umphress, Chair** announced the following meeting dates:
 - November 21, 2019
 - Thursday, February 20, 2020
 - Tuesday, May 19, 2020
 - Thursday, August 20, 2020
 - Tuesday, November 17, 2020

Call to the Public

- **Diane Umphress, Chair** gave the call to the public and reminded all present of the standards and rules that must be followed under public meeting law.
- **Kacie Kliebert** commented on orders of protection being particularly onerous and difficult. Ms. Clearbert provided personal examples of concerns in protection orders and requested that the process become more victim friendly.
- **Felicia Chew** commented on systematic domestic violence concerns, including unsympathetic judges who will yell at her and not allow her to properly present. Ms. Chew suggested developing a court oversight committee. Ms. Chew also brought up a DV awareness series she would be hosting in Tucson and provided information to attend.
- **Patricia Cummins** spoke regarding her concerns that the judges in Pima County are not trained appropriately to understand Adverse Childhood Events or Domestic Violence. Ms. Patty made statements that she wanted proceeding to change to include a swearing in of the Judge for each case to hold them accountable to the constitution.
- **Melinda Sherwyn** spoke on court advocacy and parent alienation that occurs. Ms. Sherwyn spoke to strengthening the checks and balances for judges in family courts.
- **Christa Isom** gave personal testimony of her own Domestic Violence case and the concerns and struggles she had with the process.
- **Laura Graham** also spoke about parental alienation and the request for having ongoing educational training for judges in order to have more knowledgeable and sympathetic case rulings.

Adjourn

- **Diane Umphress, Chair** called for adjournment at 11:59am. **Ms. Laura Guild** motioned to adjourn, **Mr. Steve Stahl** seconded the motion.

Dated the 15th of August 2019
Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women
Respectfully Submitted By:
Gaelyn Davis
Executive Assistant, GOYFF